Title: Thematic Report on Gender Impact Assessment and the Employment Strategy
Country: Spain
Author(s): María Luisa Moltó & Celia Valiente

Copyright Disclaimer: This report was produced as part of the work of the European Commission’s Expert Group on Gender and Employment (EGGE) and was funded by the European Commission. The European Commission has granted permission for this report to be published in this website. The opinions and views expressed in this report remain the responsibility of the authors and authors alone, and should not be taken to be representative of the views of the European Commission.
Thematic Report on Gender Impact Assessment and the Employment Strategy

Gender Impact Assessment of Employment Policies in Spain

María Luisa Moltó, Universitat de València, Spain
Celia Valiente, Universidad Carlos III de Madrid, Spain

20 October 2000.
Introduction

The objectives of this thematic report on gender impact assessment in employment policies in Spain are: i) to review the state of development of gender impact assessment of employment policies in Spain; ii) to provide information on and to review any guidelines on gender impact assessment that have been or are being developed within member states; iii) to identify barriers to gender impact assessment, related to statistical information, gender expertise, lack of political mechanisms in place, etc.; and iv) to undertake gender impact assessments of two measures included within the National Action Plans on Employment (NAPs), using the gender impact assessment methodology outlined in the Gender Mainstreaming Report (Rubery et al., 1999). The two policies to be assessed are: job training schemes; and measures to help workers combine professional and family responsibilities (the so-called 'reconciliation' policies).

Overview of the State of Development of Gender Impact Assessment in Employment Policies in Spain

Broadly speaking, systematic and comprehensive gender impact assessments of public policies have not been undertaken in Spain yet. This is true for all areas of public policies and not only for employment policies. Given the quasi-absence of gender
impacts, in this section of the report we briefly present the main conclusions of academic studies on gender equality policy. We also succinctly describe the chief findings of (non-academic) yearly reports by the Economic and Social Council (Consejo Económico y Social, CES) on economic and social policy. We have decided to comment on the CES reports because they contain a gender-sensitive perspective, although these are not strictly gender impact assessments.

**Academic Studies on Gender Equality Policy Making**

Research on public policy is still very underdeveloped in Spain (Colino et al., 1994:530-531). There is not (yet) a study which systematically evaluates the scope of all laws and policies on equality between women and men at the central state level, although the first attempts in this direction include: Threlfall (1996); Gil (1996); Sensat and Varella (1998). Some studies have already been done about: public policies for working women (Valiente, 1997a); child care policies (Valiente, 1995a); policies against violence against women (Valiente, 1996b); family policy (Valiente, 1996c); and the regulation of sexual harassment in the work place (Valiente, 1998). All these works are studies of the policy-making process in relation to gender equality, but pay little attention to the evaluation of the policies--an exception is Bustelo (1999).

Thanks to the aforementioned studies on gender equality
policy in Spain, we know some characteristics of this policy area at the national level. We also can begin to detect the role played by a female power elite: the femocrats. The establishment of most gender equality policies has been promoted in Spain in the last two decades by state feminists, and/or feminists within trade unions and parties, rather than by the women's movement or by both, as in other countries. Feminists within the women's machinery, unions and parties have been very influential in the first stages of the policy-making process (problem definition and agenda setting) but not in the last stages (policy formulation and policy implementation). Their influence has been mainly on problem definition. These feminists have been quite active in the task of converting 'private' matters into 'public' problems. As a consequence, important political and social actors and some sectors of public opinion have begun to conceptualize issues such as sexual harassment in the work place not as 'facts of life' or citizens' own business, as they had done at the past, but as social problems which deserve public attention (and solutions).

Feminists within women's machinery, political parties and trade unions have also had a positive record of agenda-setting. They have succeeded in persuading other political actors to

---

1 Since the 1970s institutions with the concrete purpose of promoting gender equality have been set, developed (and sometimes even dismantled) in most industrial countries. Such institutions have been called in social science literature 'state feminist' institutions, bureaucracies or machineries. The people who work there are named 'state feminists' or 'femocrats' (Stetson and Mazur, 1995).
introduce equality goals onto their agendas. In fact, had they not been active, many state units would probably never have established equality measures, or would have established them later than they actually did. It is impossible, however, to make a similarly positive assessment of the importance of the performance of feminists in the stages of policy formulation and implementation. Specific and concrete measures to tackle various types of gender inequalities are actually formulated within the ministries and/or in Parliament. Ministries in general try hard to preserve and reinforce their own powers. Feminists within state feminist institutions, parties and unions have little influence in these two arenas when a choice is being made from among the various alternatives available to address a problem. The implementation of gender equality measures is in the hands of state units (mainly the ministries) for which gender equality is not a priority. Hence, equality programs are at times not implemented in Spain and are often dismissed as merely 'symbolic', in the sense that they do not solve the problems that they are supposed to address. Nevertheless, equality policy might serve important functions, among them, to be a first step in the fight against gender inequalities, and to help persuade the population to behave in a more gender-equal manner (Valiente, 1998).

We hardly know anything about laws and policies on equality between women and men at the regional level.\footnote{Two exceptions to this general rule are the study undertaken by Elizondo and Martínez (1995) on the Basque country and that}
The topic of feminist institutions at the regional level is practically unknown. Astelarra (1996:263) has argued (but not empirically tested) that although the formal characteristics of women's machineries at the regional level are very similar, the de facto capacity of these machines to promote policies varies a lot.

Similarly, gender equality policies at the local level constitute an almost unexplored territory for researchers. The few studies undertaken tend to analyze localities of a single region --for instance, Madrid (Valiente, 1998-1999)-- although a study focused on the whole country (Sampedro, 1992). Mendizábal and Ortiz (1996) argued that some localities tend to specialize into the delivery of programs for women in specially disadvantaged positions (for instance, living on social assistance), while regions and the central state tend to deliver programs for women in more diverse situations. Specially interesting are the practical conclusions of a pioneer study on local gender equality policies promoted by twelve city councils in Catalonia (Jiménez et al., 1998). After evaluating these measures, a guide to identify good practices was produced (Proyecto Estela, 1998). This guide is an instrument to be used by any institution at the local, regional or central state level undertaking gender equality made by Bustelo (1997) on the evaluation of national and regional equality plans. An equality plan is a policy instrument which consists of a set of gender equality measures to be undertaken by different state units in a given period.

3 Two pioneer descriptive studies have been made by Elizondo and Martínez (1995) for the Basque country and by Granados (1999) for Andalusia.
Gender equality policies promoted by state feminist institutions of the central state at the regions have at times been evaluated (Bustelo, 1999). These evaluations have sometimes been carried out by the feminist institutions which promoted the policies. For instance, the main feminist institution at the central state level, the Women's Institute (Instituto de la Mujer) evaluated itself the equality plans that it promoted. The evaluation of the second equality plan is analyzed in the next section of this report (see below). In other cases, external experts evaluate the implementation of equality plans undertaken by feminist institutions.

In sum, most academic studies on gender equality policies do not evaluate these policies but analyze the political process that lead to these measures. Policies for women promoted by feminist institutions have at times been evaluated in Spain (Bustelo, 1999). In the next section of the report we describe the main characteristics of these evaluations. What is hardly made in Spain is a gender assessment of public policies different than those promoted by gender equality institutions.

An exception to this general rule are the yearly reports of the Economic and Social Council (Consejo Económico y Social, CES) on economic and social policies. It is to the analysis of the CES reports that we now turn.
The yearly reports of the Economic and Social Council

The Economic and Social Council (CES hereafter) is a consultative organ of the government for economic and social matters composed (among others) by representatives of employers and workers and independent experts. Since 1994, the CES publishes a yearly report on economic and social policies. This influential publication usually considers the different positions of men and women in most policy areas. As an illustration, we analyze how the last CES yearly report evaluates the Employment Agreement of 1997. Despite the positive evaluation in relation to the stability of employment contracts (more permanent contracts and longer short-term contracts), a non-neutral gender effect of the new type of permanent contracts is reported (Consejo Económico y Social, 2000:270). A comparison is established between the percentage of women who benefitted from permanent contracts in 1998 (34%) and their representation in the total of contracts (40%). This situation becomes slightly better in 1999, when gender was introduced as an explicit criterion in the employment policy (Act Number 50 of 30 December 1998). As a result, the

We can only speculate about the reasons that explain this gender sensitivity in the CES. It is reasonable to suspect that gender notions are included at length in the CES yearly reports due among other factors to the fact that Carlota Bustelo has been a member of the small committee in charge of the elaboration of the yearly reports. Carlota Bustelo was the director of the Women's Institute between 1983 and 1988, a socialist member of parliament in the late 1970s and an activist in the feminist movement in the early and mid 1970s.
percentage of women in new permanent contracts increased to 36% and their participation in the transformation of temporary contracts into permanent contracts was even higher (39%). However, in 1999 women were still underrepresented in the employment promotion measures. This underrepresentation is mostly due to the fact that women under 30 (who are also overrepresented among the unemployed) increased their participation in those contracts only one percentage point from 1998 (38%) to 1999 (39%).

Apart from its yearly reports, the CES has produced other gender-sensitive publications relevant to the study of the labor market. For instance, in 1996 a special report on part-time employment examined the matter both in Europe and Spain (Consejo Económico y Social, 1996). This CES study provided a lot of statistical information desegregated by sex for 1987, 1991, and 1995. This CES study should be considered one of the points of departure for improving the social protection of part-time contracts in Spain from 1994 onwards.

Identification and Discussion of any Evaluation/Gender Impact Assessment of Employment Policies in Spain

As stated above, some equality policies promoted by state feminist institutions have been evaluated in Spain (Bustelo, 1997; 1999). In this section, we will briefly comment on one of these evaluations: that carried out by the Women's Institute (Instituto de la Mujer, WI in what follows) on the Second Equality Plan
(Instituto de la Mujer, 1996). The WI is the institution at the central-state with the explicit mandate to promote women's rights and status (Threlfall, 1996; 1998; Valiente, 1995b; 1997b). The WI was officially created in 1983 (Act 16 of 24 October). The WI, as most 'state feminist' institutions of Western countries, has neither the power nor the budget to formulate and implement most gender equality policies. Instead, it has to convince other state units to elaborate women's equality policies. The WI has promoted three equality plans, put in practice in 1988-1990, 1993-1995 and 1997-2000 (Instituto de la Mujer, 1988; 1993; 1997). As said, an equality plan is a policy instrument. It is a set of gender equality measures to be implemented mainly by the ministries. The WI is in charge of monitoring the implementation of the equality plans and has produced the evaluation of the first two (Instituto de la Mujer, 1990; 1996). The description of the instrument to evaluate the second equality plan has also been published (Álvaro, De la Fuente and Aranda, 2000).

The evaluation of the second gender equality plan is an important step towards the generalization of evaluations of public policies in Spain. However, this evaluation shares with other evaluations undertaken in Spain two shortcomings that should be overcome in the future. On the one hand, the first part of the evaluation of the second gender equality plan comprises a study on the changes and continuities in women's status before and after the implementation of the plan. Nevertheless, what is not assessed is which changes and continuities are the result of the
implementation of the plan, and which ones are not. Therefore, the effects of the plan are not identified. On the other hand, the evaluation of the second equality plan also includes an assessment of the degree of the implementation of the measures of the plan. At times the assessment is simply the answer to the question of whether the measures have been put in practice or not, and whether the budget allocated to the implementation of the measures have been spent or not. There is rarely the answer to the question about whether the specific measures were the appropriate means to reach given objectives, or whether unintended effects appeared.

An aspect of the evaluation of the Second national equality plan worth to emphasize is the efforts made by the evaluation to take in mind the opinions of beneficiaries of the concrete programs about the usefulness of these concrete measures. The views of state officials involved in the implementation of measures were also taken seriously in the evaluation.

In brief, evaluations of public policies in Spain should try to distinguish between social change produced by the public policy under evaluation from any other social change. Evaluations should also go much beyond the (important) task of checking that measures have been implemented and that the monetary resources allocated to the implementation of measures have been spent in due time.

Identification of Continuing Barriers to Gender Impact Assessment
Generally speaking, there are four barriers to gender impact assessment in Spain: statistical barriers; lack of gender expertise; lack of policy assessment expertise; and lack of political and bureaucratic mechanisms for assessment.

Regarding statistical barriers, a big effort has been undertaken in the last two decades to desegregate statistics by sex. However, more needs to be done in this direction. For instance, most statistics on wages and salaries are still not desegregated by sex.

As for lack of gender expertise, academic experts on gender are one of the potential professionals to assess the gender impact of public policies. Comparatively speaking, there are less experts of this type in Spain than in other European Union (EU) member states. The lack of expertise and research in gender matters in Spain is mainly due to two reasons: the negative image that gender issues has among most researchers; and the degree of institutionalization of gender studies in Spain.

Uriarte (1997:17-18) has convincingly argued that in Spain, the negative image of gender research among most scholars is due to historical development of this area of knowledge. Most people who do studies on gender happen to be feminist women. This is a practical obstacle for the development of research on gender, because being a feminist is regarded negatively by society and by the academic world. Gender research is a risky option for scholars, who may be denigrated by others (whether openly or not). It is not therefore surprising that the degree of
institutionalization of gender studies in Spain is generally low. The central organizational unit of the Spanish university system is the department. No gender studies department exists. It is not currently possible to get a degree in gender studies in the university. This means that all scholars who do research on gender develop their academic careers in departments dedicated to other disciplines, such as economics, sociology or political science, among others. Generally speaking, such scholars teach courses not on gender but on other topics. To some extent this is also true for research: if they want to fit in to their departments, scholars have to publish on areas other than gender. If they might choose to dedicate some of (or all) their time and resources on research on gender, they risk not fitting in to their departments. This institutional framework is a powerful barrier to many scholars interested in gender (Uriarte, 1997).

With respect to lack of policy assessment expertise, in general, courses on policy evaluation are extremely rare in undergraduate and graduate studies in Spanish universities. Therefore, students do not learn in the university the skills necessary to assess measures. As an illustration of the lack of courses on program assessment, let us point to the course catalog of the Open University (Universidad Nacional de Educación a Distancia, UNED). In academic year 2000-2001, there is not any

---

Gender research has acquired a certain degree of institutionalization, for instance, with the creation of inter-departmental gender research institutes.
course on policy evaluation in the undergraduate studies of economics, business administration and management, sociology and political science. Of course, in the Spanish labor market, there are (very few) professionals who have the necessary skills to evaluate policies and programs. Some of these professionals learn these skills when they work in multi-national consulting companies which (among other of their activities) assess measures, for instance, Arthur-Andersen (personal communication of Elizabeth Villagómez of the Fundación Tomillo to Celia Valiente, Madrid, 10 August 2000).

In regard to lack of political and bureaucratic mechanisms for assessment, most state units are not legally required to carry out evaluations of the policies that they implement. Even if state units are mandated to assess policies, they do not usually have any specific department of evaluation. As an illustration of this point, let us consider again the Women's Institute. One of the WI's goals is to oversee the implementation of women's policy. As said before, the WI has already made the evaluation

---

6 The course catalog of the UNED be consulted at: www.uned.es.

7 There are exceptions to this general pattern, such as the General Directorate of Planning and Evaluation of the Ministry of Health, or the Evaluation Agency of the Ministry of Education and Culture (Fernández-Ballesteros, 2000:14).

8 The scope of the WI is very broad, since the WI has four other comprehensive goals: to promote policy initiatives for women through formal enactment of policy statements; to study all aspects of women's situation in Spain; to receive and handle women's discrimination complaints; and to increase women's knowledge of their rights.
of the first two equality plans (Instituto de la Mujer, 1990; 1996). However, there is not a department within the WI specialized in policy evaluation. It is important to note that in practice absolutely nothing happened if a ministry failed to implement the equality measures it was supposed to introduce (and this failure is reported in the evaluations carried out by the WI), because the WI has no powers of sanction over ministries. This lack of powers of sanction is not a peculiarity of the WI, since in Spain, in general, hardly any institution exists with enough power to control (in real as opposed to symbolic terms) other institutions of similar status. For this reason, consciously or otherwise, WI staff have acted as if it were reasonable to concentrate their efforts on other objectives other than policy evaluation which are considered more easily realizable.


**Definition of Job Training and Justification of Our Selection of Job Training Policies for this Gender Impact Assessment**

We will evaluate job training policies (*formación continua* and *formación ocupacional*), that is, training schemes for employed and unemployed individuals. The terms 'professional training' and 'occupational training' are also used in this assessment to
evaluate job training policies included in the Spanish 2000 Action Plan for Employment ('Spanish 2000 NAP' in what follows). We will not study vocational training (formación profesional), that is, measures for students, because vocational training is a part of the education policy, not a part of employment policy. In Spain, there is a clear separation between employment and education policies, since these are targeted to different people and are administered by different institutions. Job training policies are directed to people in the labor market (whether employed or unemployed). Job training policies are administered by: the National Institute of Employment (Instituto Nacional de Empleo) upon the authority of the Ministry of Labor and Social Affairs of the central state; regions; trade unions; and employers' organizations. Money to finance job training programs comes from the European Social Fund and mandatory contributions by employers and workers (0.7% of the payroll). Generally speaking, vocational training is an education track for students who have completed mandatory education but will not attend high school and university. Vocational training is administered by: the Ministry of Education and Culture of the central state; and the regions.

We have chosen job training in the Spanish 2000 NAP mainly because of three reasons. First, the Spanish 2000 NAP contains a high number of references to job training. Therefore, occupational training schemes are an important part of the Spanish 2000 NAP. Second, references to professional training appear in all pillars of the Spanish 2000 NAP, and not only in pillar 4 (on
gender equality). Therefore, we will assess the gender impact of a policy (job training) that had not been originally conceived as a gender equality policy. Lastly, job training is a big industry, and therefore a chief part of labor market policies independently of its centrality in the Spanish 2000 NAP. In 1996, the number of employed people following job training courses reached the proportion of 15% of the waged working population (Consejo Económico y Social, 1997:253; provisional data).

*Background: The Policy Area of Job Training in Spain*

It is necessary to provide the reader with some historical background regarding the policy area of professional training. During the Francoist period, the most important job training scheme developed in the 1960s and was managed through the Program for Professional Workers' Promotion (*Programa de Promoción Profesional Obrera*, PPO). Short-term occupational courses were given in order to provide people of agrarian background with the basic skills to work in industries and the service sector. Agricultural workers were also trained in the use of agricultural technology. Other occupational programs different and less important than the PPO were also developed (Pérez-Díaz, 1995:9; Pérez-Díaz and Rodríguez, 1994:24).

During the transition to democracy, these job training

---

9 From the mid-1930s to 1975 Spain was governed by a right-wing authoritarian regime headed by General Francisco Franco.
programs languished. In 1978 the National Institute of Employment (Instituto Nacional de Empleo, INEM) was created with three main functions: to administer unemployment benefits, to be an employment agency, and to manage training courses. The PPO (which had changed its name in 1973) became part of the INEM. In practice, the INEM fulfilled its first function (managing unemployment subsidies), which was an immense task given the rising levels of unemployment. Mainly due to the small number of INEM employees, the INEM hardly performed its second function (matching job searchers and job suppliers), and the same was true for its third function (administering training programs). As a result, the number of people who attended occupational courses sank: from approximately 300,000 in 1975 to around 60,000 in 1985 (Pérez-Díaz and Rodríguez, 1994:25).

Spain became a member of the European Community (EC) in 1986. Spanish policy-makers knew that the European Social Fund financed up to 65% of occupational training activities in EC member states, provided that member states financed the remaining part. Spanish decision makers realized that Spain would risk missing this opportunity to receive European money in the absence of a comprehensive job training policy. Therefore, in 1985 they approved a comprehensive national plan on the matter, the so-called National Plan of Professional Training and Insertion (Plan Nacional de Formación e Inserción Profesional, 'FIP Plan' hereafter). One of the objectives of the FIP plan was to develop occupational programs directed to some groups, among them the
unemployed.

The amount of resources dedicated to job training rose immediately after the approval of the FIP plan. Public expenditure on this matter was (in monetary terms): 15,306 million pesetas in 1985; 47,710 in 1986; and 134,000 in 1989 (Fundación Encuentro, 1993:186). The number of people taking these courses also mounted, from around 60,000 in 1985 to more than 400,000 in the early 1990s (Pérez-Díaz and Rodríguez, 1994:25). These courses were mainly directed to the unemployed and to young people looking for their first jobs and not to people already employed (Fundación Encuentro, 1993:187). In general, beneficiaries of job training programs had a low level of education: in the late 1980s and early 1990s approximately 50% of them had only attended compulsory school (whether having completed this level of education or not) (Fundación Encuentro, 1993:188).

In the early 1990s it was clear that the training of workers (and not only of the unemployed or the young searching for their first jobs) needed attention. On December 16, 1992 two pacts were signed between the state and the social partners.⁵ Up till then, the National Institute of Employment (Instituto Nacional de Empleo, INEM) was in charge of the management of training programs.

---

¹⁰ The two 1992 pacts were: the National Agreement on Continuous Training (Acuerdo Nacional de Formación Continua) signed by trade unions and employers' organizations; and the Tripartite Agreement on Continuous Training for the Employed (Acuerdo Tripartito en Materia de Formación Continua de los Trabajadores Ocupados) signed by the state, trade unions and employers' organizations.
for the unemployed and the employed. Since then, the INEM remained responsible for the management of occupational courses for the unemployed. Courses for the employed would be managed jointly by representatives of workers and employers (but not of the state). Bipartite foundations with representatives of workers and employers were created for this purpose. The foundation at the national level was called the Foundation for the Continuous Training in the Enterprise (Fundación para la Formación Continua en la Empresa, FORCEM). The aforementioned agreements also established the promotion of on-the-job training activities in big enterprises, and in groups of small or medium enterprises (Consejo Económico y Social, 1997; Pérez-Díaz, 1994:10).

On December 19, 1996, the state, trade unions and employers' organizations signed other three agreements. These contain the commitment to elaborate a National System of Certificates (sistema

---

11 Although the management of occupational training for workers was transferred to the social partners, the money to finance these programs is collected by the state. As explained before, the money for all programs (whether directed to the unemployed or the employed) comes from two sources: the European Social Fund and mandatory contributions by employers and workers (0.7% of the payroll).

12 The three 1996 pacts were: the Draft Agreement on Job Training Policy (Acuerdo de Bases sobre la Política de Formación Profesional); the Second National Agreement on Continuous Training (Segundo Acuerdo Nacional de Formación Continua); and the Tripartite Agreement on Continuous Training (Acuerdo Tripartito sobre Formación Continua). The first agreement was signed by the government, the two main unions (UGT and CCOO) and employers' organizations (CEOE and CEPYME). The second and third agreements were signed by the government, UGT, CCOO, CEOE, CEPYME and another trade union, the Confederación Intersindical Gallega (Consejo Económico y Social, 1997:249-250).
nacional de cualificaciones) to assure the validation among certificates obtained in vocational training courses, job training courses for the employed and for the unemployed (Consejo Económico y Social, 1997:251). The agreements also established more incentives for small companies to provide training for their workers (Consejo Económico y Social, 1997:259). More categories of workers were included among the potential beneficiaries of on-the-job training programs including the self-employed and agricultural workers.

During the Francoist dictatorship, the state was highly centralized. During the transition to democracy, a broad process of devolution of powers from the central state to the regions (not so much to the localities) was set in motion. Responsibilities which had previously belonged to the central state, such as job training, have been transferred to some regions, for instance, to Catalonia (1991); Valencia (1992); Galicia and Andalusia (1993); and Canary Islands (1994). Thus, in the 1990s, the job training system has become more open, including new players from the regions.

Step 1: Identification of the Position of Men and Women prior to the Spanish 2000 NAP with Respect to Participation, Resources, Norms and Values, and Rights

13 In Spain, the majority of companies are very small ones: in 1995, 58% of the companies did not employ any person, 24% employed one or two people and 13% employed between 3 and 9 people (Consejo Económico y Social, 1997:258).
Participation--In the past decades, an increasing number and proportion of women had participated in job training schemes. For example, according to the Spanish 2000 NAP, 281,909 unemployed women and 226,441 unemployed men took part in 1999 in job training schemes for unemployed individuals.

Resources--We have not found any specific study on the resources used to finance job training courses for women and men respectively. Nor have we found reliable primary data with which to assess the amount of money spent on occupational training received by men and women.

Norms and Values--To our knowledge, there is not any specific survey on norms and values regarding gender and job training.

Rights--According to the Constitution, women and men are equal before the law. Thus in theory women and men have equal rights to benefit from job training. The increasing number and proportion of women enrolled in job training schemes over the past years means that barriers against women in the policy area of occupational training are not insurmountable. To our knowledge, there are not micro-studies on the access of women and men to job training in specific companies and trades. These studies are necessary, in order to know whether or not there are de facto differences in the access of both sexes to occupational schemes in specific companies and trades.

Some job training courses are delivered during the work day, while many others are not. Given the division of labor within
most families, women with small children have more difficulties than men with small children to participate in activities not included in the work day. Given the limitations in the provision of public child care in Spain (Valiente, 1995a), some (or many) women with family responsibilities have in theory the right to job training but may find in practice difficult to exercise this right.

Step 2: Assessment of the Trends in Men's and Women's Position Independently of the Effects of the Job Training Policies Proposed in the Spanish 2000 NAP

Independently of the effects of the job training policies proposed in the Spanish 2000 NAP, it is likely that what has been described in step 1 will also apply to the future. Women will participate in job training activities in a number and proportion not significantly smaller than men. Women with children and other family responsibilities will find hard to take part in occupational activities that do not take place during the work day.

Step 3: Determination of the Priority to be Attached to Adopting Policies which Actively Promote Gender Equality (as Opposed to Policies which are Simply Gender Neutral)

In the Spanish 2000 NAP, job training policies which actively
promote gender equality are given a considerably lower priority than job training policies which are simply gender neutral. Job training policies which actively promote gender equality are not negligible, but usually appear in pillar 4 (on gender equality) and are going to be financed with a very small amount of money. In practice, this means that job training policies which actively promote gender equality will be programs affecting a very small number of women. Job training policies which actively promote gender equality are briefly described and assessed in step 4 of this evaluation.

Gender-neutral job training policies (and not only job training policies which actively promote gender equality) can be very beneficial to women. However, other gender-neutral measures can benefit men disproportionally. The Spanish 2000 NAP contains the latter type of measures. This is the case of job training schemes targeted at workers with family responsibilities. For instance, pillar 1 (guidelines 3 and 4) describes an Insertion Program of Active Income (Programa de Renta Activa de Inserción), which will offer training and other active labor market programs and income to 90,000 long-term unemployed people older than 45 with family responsibilities whose right to receive unemployment benefits has been exhausted. These people tend to be male breadwinners. This is the reason why women's departments within the main trade unions have criticized labor market policies in general (and not only job training policies) targeted to workers with family responsibilities. Women's departments within the main
trade unions have instead demanded programs targeted to any type of worker.

Step 4: Assessment of the Potential Impact of Policy

The following six job training measures of the Spanish 2000 NAP include references to gender and are assessed now. Generally speaking, we value positively these specific mentions to gender, and consider that these measures (if de facto applied) will help to erode gender inequality. However, we consider negatively that at times: a specific budget is not clearly associated with the concrete measures; that numerical targets are not specified (for instance, how many women will be the beneficiaries of a given scheme); and that some measures are of pilot nature (being financed with a very limited budget and affecting a very small number of women).

1. The Spanish 2000 NAP declares that women will participate in active labor market policies (which include job training) according to their presence in unemployment (pilar 1, guidelines 1 and 2; pilar 4, guideline 18). We assess this goal positively for two reasons. First, job training can be a tool to combat unemployment, which disproportionally hurts Spanish women.

---

14 In order to understand the position of women's departments within the main trade unions regarding job training policies, we have exhaustively consulted all articles on women's matters on all issues of Unión and Gaceta Sindical in the last two decades. Unión and Gaceta Sindical are the periodical journals of the General Workers' Union and the Workers' Commissions respectively.
Second, this is a numerical goal, and therefore will be easy to evaluate after the implementation of the Plan.

2. The Spanish 2000 NAP states that job training in companies will be preferentially directed to groups of workers likely to be expelled from the labor market, such as aged workers, women, and low-qualified workers (pilar 1, guidelines 5, 6, 7 and 8). However, there is not any numerical target specified for this goal. This means that this goal may end up being a symbolic declaration.

3. The Spanish 2000 NAP declares that special attention will be given to job training for people who re-enter the labor market (pilar 4, introductory paragraph). Presumably, the majority of these people are women. Later on, this target is repeated in more concrete terms, for instance, in the commitment to dedicate 484 million pesetas (2,91 million euros) to programs of training and orientation of people who re-enter the labor market in the cities and the countryside (pilar 4, guideline 21). However, the amount of money dedicated to the program is small. Generally speaking, this tends to be the case of the policies which actively promote gender equality (in any policy area in Spain, and not only regarding job training in the Spanish 2000 NAP). As a result, policies which actively promote gender equality tend to have an experimental nature, and consist in pilot projects put in practice during a short time span which affect a very low number of women.

4. The Spanish 2000 NAP affirms that people who are on leave from work because of family responsibilities (for instance, taking
care of a child) can participate in job training programs in companies in equal terms as people working. We assess this commitment positively, since it will allow some women to gain useful skills to re-enter the labor market. However, attention should be paid to the *de facto* implementation of this measure, in order to find whether it is in fact applied or not (and therefore becomes a symbolic declaration of principles, with no beneficial effects for women in real life).

5. The Spanish 2000 NAP affirms that 903 million pesetas (5.4 million euros) will be dedicated to active labor market policies oriented towards two aims: i) to foster female entrepreneurship and; ii) encourage women to learn skills in the field of new technologies. The acquisition of these skills will make possible the diversification of women's professional options (pilar 4, guideline 19). We value in positive terms this measure, although given the small amount of money dedicated to it, this measure will be another pilot program affecting very few women.

6. The Spanish 2000 NAP includes the commitment to continue job training and orientation programs directed to lone mothers with family responsibilities (pilar 4, guideline 21). There is not any specific budget allocated for this measure, nor any numerical target (for example, how many women are going to participate in these training and orientation activities). Therefore, there is a potential risk that this measure is finally not implemented.
Step 5: Assessment of the Impact of the Policy on Particular Groups of Women and Men

Ethnic minority groups--The main ethnic community in Spain is the gypsy community. It is likely that gypsy women benefit less than non-gypsy women from job training policies included in the Spanish 2000 NAP, because gypsy women participate in the labor market to a much lower extent than non-gypsy women, and because there is not any job training program specifically directed to the gypsy community.

Parents or non parents--Probably, non parents will benefit more than parents with small children from job training programs that take place after the work day, since there are not measures of child care associated to job training schemes.

Age groups--In general, younger cohorts of women are significantly more educated than older cohorts of women. Younger cohorts of women participate in the labor market to a remarkably higher extent than older cohorts of women. For these two reasons and other things equal, younger women will probably benefit more than job training schemes in the Spanish 2000 NAP than older women (although the Spanish 2000 NAP declares that special attention will be paid to job training of people specially vulnerable to be expelled from the labor market, such as old workers).

Educational groups--What has been said regarding age groups also applies to educational groups. Broadly speaking, the higher the level of education of women, the higher their likelihood to
participate in the labor market (as employed or as unemployed individuals). Thus, women with high levels of education will probably benefit more from job training policies in the Spanish 2000 NAP than women with low levels of education.

Those in work and those out of work—For the reasons already described, women in the labor market (whether employed or officially registered as unemployed) will benefit from job training schemes included in the Spanish 2000 NAP. Women who are not employed and are not officially registered as unemployed are considered in public policy terms as people outside the labor market. Job training policies are not targeted to people who do not participate in the labor market.

Handicapped workers, immigrants, and returning emigrants—Pilar 1, guideline 9 is dedicated to handicapped workers, immigrants, and returning emigrants. Guideline 9 refers among other programs to job training schemes. Thus, in principle, handicapped women, and female immigrants and emigrants can benefit from these schemes.

Step 6: Assessment of the Indirect Impacts of both the Current State of Gender Inequalities and the Proposed Policies, Paying Particular Attention to the Indirect Impact on Children

The impact on children of both the current state of gender inequalities regarding job training and the proposed job training policies in the Spanish 2000 NAP is extremely indirect. In
principle, if job training allows women (and men) to be better qualified and have better jobs, this could be translated into an improvement of the economic situation of their children. However, given the high rate of unemployment in Spain, and the surplus of potential workers in many (but not all) occupations and trades in comparison with the available jobs, people with more training find difficult to find better jobs.

Step 7: Recommendations

From what has been stated in this report, the following recommendations are deducted regarding job training policies in future NAPs:

1. Apparently gender-neutral measures that de facto tend to benefit a significantly higher number and proportion of men should be eliminated, reduced or compensated with measures that tend to benefit women. An example of the former are job training programs directed to long term unemployed individuals with family responsibilities, older than 45 years, and whose right to receive unemployment subsidies has been exhausted. An example of the latter type of policy is job training schemes for people on leave from the labor market because of family responsibilities.

2. Job training measures which do not have a budget associated to them should be avoided.

3. Job training measures which are not accompanied by numerical targets should also be avoided.
4. Pilot programs (of experimental nature, financed with a very limited budget, of a short-term duration and without continuity in time, and affecting a small number of women) are important devices for policy makers to learn how to elaborate more efficient gender equality policies. However, while it may be reasonable that some job training policies which actively promote gender equality have a pilot nature, this should not be the general rule.

5. The evaluation of the job training measures included in the Spanish 2000 National Plan should be made with statistics desegregated by sex for all job training programs. This evaluation (or at least part of it) will presumably be a part of Spanish 2001 NAP, since the first part of the Spanish 2000 NAP is a symmetric evaluation of the implementation of the 1999 Spanish NAP.


Reconciliation policies are policies that help working people to combine family and professional responsibilities. The list of potential reconciliation measures is long and includes among others: maternity leave; parental leave; other leaves and time off to fulfill family responsibilities; flexible working time; and the supply of care services. In this report, we have selected reconciliation measures for assessment because of two reasons:

i) The combination of family and professional duties is one
of the main challenges that Spanish women encounter when they try to participate in the labor market. The difficulty to combine work and family is one of the reasons which explain that Spain has the lowest fertility rate in the world.

ii) The current conservative government in power in the central state since 1996 has paid attention to reconciliation policies, and will probably continue to do so in the near future. Then, reconciliation policies have been in the political agenda for some years, and this will possibly be the case in the years to come.

Step 1: Identification of the Position of Men and Women prior to the Spanish 2000 NAP with Respect to Participation, Resources, Norms and Values, and Rights

Participation--Women are the overwhelming majority of people who take advantage of maternity leave. The number of fathers who take maternity leave is extremely small but not irrelevant. The Labor Force Survey (Encuesta de Población Activa) provides data desegregated by sex of wage earners who are not working during the week when the survey questionnaire is administered. In the fourth quarter of 1998, 97% of waged workers who did not work due to maternity leave were women, and the remaining 3% were men (Instituto Nacional de Estadística, 1999:204). No data is available on the number of fathers taking advantage of non-paid
leave, but our knowledge of the Spanish society tells us that the number is insignificant.

Resources--We have not been able to find data on the amount of money that the state spends on specific reconciliation policies.

Norms and values--In another place, one of us (Valiente, 1996a) has argued that men's and women's attitudes towards domestic and caring tasks have substantially changed in Spain in the last three decades. In the mid-1970s, the majority of Spaniards of both sexes considered these tasks to be the exclusive responsibilities of women (De Pablo, 1976:378; Linz, 1978:113). Subsequently, many studies have shown that an increasing number of both Spanish men and women think that domestic and care tasks should not only be performed by women (Cruz and Cobo, 1991:142; Escario et al., 1987:68; Juste et al., 1991:27; Navarro and Mateo, 1993:118-120, 124; Pérez et al., 1993:66-69).

It is important to study not only people's attitudes towards family responsibilities different from bread-winning (domestic roles and caring) but also the amount of time that individuals of both sexes spend on these practices. For there may be a significant difference between what men and women think and what they actually do. All time-use studies point to the existence of a huge difference in men's and women's contribution to household and caring duties in Spain (Alberdi, 1995; Álvaro, 1996; Carrasco, 1991:111-150; Durán, 1987; INNER, 1988:23-28; Izquierdo et al., 1988:29-48; Menéndez, 1994:89; OTR/IS, 1988:16, 24; Ramos, 1990;
1994; Tobío, 1995:57-60). Time-use studies are a relatively recent development in Spain. As a result, it is impossible to know the exact extent of change in the division of labor within families across time. However, it can reasonably be suggested that men are generally more involved in caring and domestic tasks than two or three decades ago (INNER, 1988:34; Menéndez, 1994:89).

Several factors can be put forward to explain the persistence of the gendered division of labor within Spanish families, among them, widespread assumptions regarding the centrality of mother-care for small children. It used to be commonly assumed by many men and women in Spain that care by the mother was indispensable, at least during the first years of the child's life; that women had natural instincts for caring their children which men lacked; and that, in consequence, fathers could help but they should not share this task on an equal basis (Aguinaga and Comas 1991:33; De Pablo 1976:377-382; Escario et al. 1987:84-88; Iglesias 1984:8-10; INNER 1988:54). All these beliefs were obstacles to the involvement of fathers in child care.

The profound Spanish mistrust of child care centers should be understood in the context of the ideas regarding the importance of maternal care. Many Spaniards used to believe that the full-time employment of mothers jeopardized the upbringing of small children (Alberdi et al., 1994:98-101; De Pablo 1976:375-376; Escario et al. 1987:55; INNER 1987:54; Juste et al. 1991:38-39). The idea that female employment is detrimental for small children encourages women, for a number of years at least, to have a low
commitment to waged employment in order to play a pivotal role in child care. This notion also distances fathers from care work. For many parents, child-care centers were one of the least preferable options for their children, above all until they reach the age of around 3 years (if not afterwards as well). Mother care used to be the preferred care option. When the mother did not stay at home day and night to take care of her offspring, the second preference of many parents was that which is most similar to the full-time housewife-mother: that another woman replaces the working mother in the home. Only a minority of couples could, particularly in the near future, afford to pay a woman to take care of their children (and to do the housework as well). Many other children are now cared for by their grand-mothers (Aguinaga and Comas 1991:33-35; 170-172; De Miguel 1994:820; Escario et al. 1987:89-94; Juste et al. 1991:43-44). They are frequently available to look after their grand-children because most women of these age groups are full-time housewives, and many young parents live in the same area as their parents. It can be argued, therefore, that mistrust in child care centers for small children creates incentives for women to remain at home while their children are small, at the same time as it encourages men to concentrate on bread-winning, especially in the case of families who cannot afford to hire a female child-minder or when grandmothers are not available for child care.

Rights—Men and women have the same rights to take advantage of reconciliation policies. The main exception to this rule is
the six weeks of maternity leave which are mandatory for the mother.

Step 2. Assessment of the Trends in Men's and Women's Position Independently of the Effects of the Reconciliation Policies Proposed

From the information presented above, we could infer that regardless of Spaniards' egalitarian ideas about the desirable division of household and caring duties within families, in the short-term women will continue to perform the lion's share of these duties. Possibly, (some) men will be more involved than in the past in family responsibilities different from bread-winning, and an increasing number of them will take advantage of reconciliation measures. However, the problem of combining professional and family responsibilities will continue to be on the main a women's problem. If reconciliation policies continue to be modest, as they have been in the past, women will have to continue to solve the problem of combining professional and family life relying not so much on the state but on themselves, the help provided by other family members (mainly female relatives) and/or the market. Probably, some women will continue to find that combining child rearing and paid employment is an impossible task and abandon the labor market for a number of years.

Step 3. Determination of the Priority to be Attached to Adopting
In Spain, a higher degree of gender equality will be the result of reconciliation policies only when these policies reach two aims: firstly, that more women are helped by state measures to combine paid work and family life; and secondly, that the combination of professional and family responsibilities becomes a problem of men as well as of women. Given the current gender division of labor within Spanish families, gender neutral reconciliation policies will be used mainly by women, and will therefore be directed to the first but not to the second aim. Thus we recommend policies which actively encourage men to be more active in performing family responsibilities different than breadwinning.

Step 4. Assessment of the Potential Impact of Reconciliation Policies in the Spanish 200 NAP with Respect to Participation, Resources, Norms and Values, and Rights

As shown next, the potential impact of reconciliation policies in the Spanish 2000 NAP will be limited, given the small attention paid to these policies by the Spanish 2000 NAP. Reconciliation policies will mainly affect (a very modest number of) women but hardly men.

Reconciliation policies are mentioned in the Spanish 2000 NAP
in three contexts. Firstly, the assessment of the Spanish 1999 NAP highlights as a major achievement the approval of Act 39/1999 of 5 November to promote the combination of workers' family and professional responsibilities. Secondly, the section on the general objectives of the Spanish 2000 NAP contains the aim 'to encourage gender equal opportunities, developing the combination of family and professional life and eliminating discrimination'.

Thirdly, specific reconciliation measures appear in Pillars 2, 3 and 4. Guideline 12 of Pillar 2 states that the Spanish 2000 NAP 'will foster local development by providing technical and economic support to newly created companies...Priority will be given to activities linked to...child care centers and the provision of caring services for the elderly'. Guideline 16 of pillar 3 affirms that the Spanish 2000 NAP 'will enhance assistance to internal migrations...with aids to child care expenses.' Guideline 20 of pillar 4 proposes 'to set up a plan of child care centers financed with public money. This plan will by undertaken [by the central state] in cooperation with the regions and localities. This plan will generate both jobs for women and services which facilitate women's paid employment. Guideline 21 of pillar 4 states that the Spanish 2000 NAP will foster job training for people on leave from their jobs because of family responsibilities.

The major shortcoming of the reconciliation measures included

---

15 In this report, all translations from Spanish to English are made by María Luisa Moltó and Celia Valiente.
in the Spanish 2000 NAP and described in the preceding paragraph is their high degree of abstraction. Therefore, we can only speculate about their potential impact. Regarding participation, mainly women will benefit from these measures, since women are usually the people who are in charge of household and caring duties in Spanish families. With respect to resources, very few are dedicated to reconciliation measures. We have calculated that 0.6% of the total budget of the Spanish 2000 NAP is dedicated to reconciliation policies. This percentage is a significant increase in comparison with the Spanish 1999 NAP, where the amount of resources dedicated to reconciliation policies was nearly 0%. As regards norms and values, these will remain mainly unmodified by the reconciliation policies, given the few people who will take advantage of them, the few resources dedicated to finance these policies, and the fact that their beneficiaries would predictably be women. Thus the non-written norm that prescribes the need of women's presence in the family home will not be eroded by these policies, to which theoretically women and men have equal rights.

Step 5. Assessment of the Impact of Reconciliation Policies on Particular Groups of Women and Men

Given the high level of abstraction of the reconciliation policies included in the Spanish 2000 NAP, it is not possible to assess their impact on particular groups of women. Probably, the policies will hardly have any effect on men.
Step 6. Assessment of the Indirect Impact of Reconciliation Policies on Children

The indirect impact of reconciliation policies on children will be small but not negligible. The children of the few workers (mainly female workers) who will take advantage of reconciliation policies will be better cared for their working parents (or mothers).

Step 7. Recommendations

We recommend that next NAPs pay more attention than the Spanish 2000 NAP to reconciliation policies, because the combination of family and professional duties is one of the main obstacles that Spanish women face while trying to participate in the labor market. The conservative government managed to pass an Act on reconciliation in November 1999. The intense mass media campaign presenting the reconciliation Act to the population may probably have created expectations in the citizenry of further reconciliation policies. These have not been established yet. We also recommend that future reconciliation policies are not formulated in abstract but in more concrete terms, for instance specifying clearly numerical targets to be reach and the budget allocated to the measures. Finally, we recommend that some reconciliation measures are directed to men, in order to help
transforming the combination of paid work and care into a problem of concern for the two sexes and not only for one of them.

Appendix: The Policy Area of Reconciliation Measures

In all societies, women are those who overwhelmingly provide care to people who for any reason need the care of others, such as the frail elderly, the disabled, the ill or small children (Orloff, 1993:313). This provision of care is in some cases conflictual or even incompatible with the requirements of the performance of waged work. Of course, it cannot be argued that women have a subordinate position in the Spanish labor market only because a significant number of them perform (unpaid) care work for others. In fact, some women do not provide care to other people at all, while others do it during limited periods during their lives. The reasons which account for the different positions of men and women in the labor market are multiple. Nevertheless, other things equal, a country facilitates female labor force participation more than a country without these policies.

Generally speaking, in post-authoritarian Spain reconciliation policies have been modest but not negligible. Let us illustrate this point with the example of the policies directed to children younger than 6 years old, when mandatory school
With respect to children younger than 6, four main policies exist in Spain: maternity leave and parental leave; child allowances; tax exemptions in concept of dependent children; and child care services. As for maternity leave and parental leave, working mothers who have been previously employed and have contributed to the social security system at least 180 days within the 5 years previous to child birth are entitled to 16 uninterrupted weeks of paid leave. The number of years contributed and the level of contribution (which is proportional to the salary) are used to calculate the so-called regulatory base (base reguladora). The amount received during maternity leave is 100 per cent of the regulatory base. The right to return to the job is guaranteed. Since 1999, if both parents perform waged work the father may take up to ten of the final weeks of the leave. Given the economic level of Spain, maternity leave is relatively generous, which is not surprising for two reasons. On the one hand, the Spanish welfare state provides relatively substantial benefits for workers who have previously made the required contributions.
contributions to the system (not for all citizens). On the other hand, as it is also the case in other continental welfare states, such as Germany, maternity leave is a substitute and not a complement to child care (O'Oconnor, forthcoming). There is also provision for up to three years of non-paid parental leave for working mothers or fathers. Return to the job is only guaranteed during the first year. The right to a job in the same professional category is guaranteed during the second and third years. The period of leave is counted as effectively worked in terms of seniority.

Child allowances (except for handicapped children) are in Spain means-tested, the income threshold established in the test of means is low (slightly above the national minimum wage) and their level is relatively modest in comparative terms. This

---

18 Esping-Andersen (1990:3-4) analyzed the variation across welfare states in industrial countries along three dimensions: the type of social rights; the type of stratification that the welfare state produces; and the interrelation of the state, the market and the family in the provision of welfare. According to the Esping-Andersen's typology of welfare states, that of Spain (and Italy, France and West Germany, among others) is of a continental type. In continental welfare states, social rights are linked to occupational categories and status (for instance, there are different insurance schemes for different types of workers). They (and their dependents) are the beneficiaries of the main social programs. The redistributive effects of social policy are minimal. A certain degree of de-commodification, that is, "the degree to which individuals, or families, can uphold a socially acceptable standard of living independently of market participation" (Esping-Andersen, 1990:37), is a result of social policy. Provision of welfare benefits is mainly public. The welfare state aims at reinforcing the traditionally crucial role of the family as welfare provider. Thus, the state tends to intervene only when the capacity of the family to act as social provider is exhausted (Esping-Andersen, 1990:27-28, 48).

19 Child allowances (prestaciones familiares por hijo a cargo)
means that child allowances are not at all an important monetary transfer which might be used to pay for child care. The same could be said with regard to tax exemptions for dependent children, whose amount is also relatively low.

As for the care of children younger than 6, in the last two decades, the main central state child care policy has been an ever increasing supply of public preschool programs for children aged three or over administered chiefly by the Ministry of Education and Culture (Ministerio de Educación y Cultura, MEC; before 1996, it was called the Ministry of Education and Science --Ministerio de Educación y Ciencia). In academic year 1996-1997, the proportion of children who attended public preschool centers was:

amounted to 36,000 pesetas per year in 1999 per dependent child younger than 18 years. These allowances were given to family units whose yearly income was lower than 1,202,991 pesetas. This income threshold increased 15 per cent for each dependent child since the second.

Child allowances for handicapped children are not means-tested and their yearly level is higher: (i) for each dependent child younger than 18 years with a degree of disability higher than 33 per cent, 72,000 pesetas in 1999; (ii) and for each dependent child older than 18 years, 455,460 pesetas if the degree of disability was higher than 65 per cent, or 683,220 pesetas if the degree of disability was higher than 75 per cent and the handicapped child needed the help of another person for basic daily activities.

In 1998, 908,347 families received child allowances. The average level of child allowances per handicapped child was 345,491 pesetas (Ministerio de Trabajo y Asuntos Sociales, 1999:901-902).

Payers of the personal income tax (Impuesto sobre la Renta de las Personas Físicas, IRPF) can be the beneficiaries of tax exemptions for each dependent child. In fiscal year 1997 (corresponding to income generated in 1996), 6,418,790 tax payers were the beneficiaries of tax exemptions in concept of dependent children. The average tax exemption was 31,572 pesetas (Ministerio de Economía y Hacienda, 2000:119; data from the whole Spain except Navarre and the Basque country).
70% of children aged 3, 4 and 5, and 43% of those aged 3. The scope of these programs is quite high in comparative terms. Since the private sector also provides pre-school places, school attendance rates of 3, 4 and 5 years old children are high in Spain in comparative terms (83%, 100%, and 100% respectively in academic year 1999-2000; provisional data). In contrast, the percentage of Spanish children aged 2 or under cared for in public centers (in academic year 1996-1997) is one of the lowest in the EU: 2.5%. The proportion of children aged 2 or under cared for in private centers is also very small: 3.5% --calculated by María Luisa Moltó and Celia Valiente from data contained in: Ministerio de Educación y Cultura (1999:79, 132-134); and data available on 17 July 2000 at http://www.mec.es/estadistica/Cifras/NAC_04.html.

In sum, as regard the care of children younger than 6, parents receive modest aid from the state: (relatively generous) maternity leave as a substitute rather than as a complement to child care; non-paid parental leave; means-tested child allowances; low tax exceptions for dependent children; and hardly any child care services for children aged 2 or under. The main exception to this general rule is the relatively generous supply of child care services for 4 and 5 years old children, services which are conceptualized by policy-makers not as reconciliation programs (with the aim of promoting the participation of mothers in the labor force) but as educational programs in the benefit of

21 For pre-school attendance rates in Spain and other industrial countries see: European Commission (1998:76); and
minors (Valiente, 1995a).

References


Álvaro, Mariano; De la Fuente, Miguel; Aranda, María T. 2000. 'La Evaluación de los Planes de Igualdad de Oportunidades entre Mujeres y Hombres (PIOM) del Instituto de la Mujer: Referencia Obligada al Segundo de Ellos' In Evaluación de las Políticas de Igualdad Ed. by Instituto de la Mujer, 93-131. Madrid: Instituto de la Mujer.


Social. Madrid: Instituto de la Mujer.


Izquierdo, Jesusa; Del Río, Olga; Rodríguez, Agustín 1988. La Desigualdad de las Mujeres en el Uso del Tiempo. Madrid: Instituto de la Mujer.

Jiménez, Eduard; Montagut, Maite; Oliver, María; Chaves, Carmen; Escobedo, Anna 1998. Estudio de Identificación y Evaluación de Buenas Prácticas en Acciones de Igualdad de Oportunidades: Resumen del Informe Final (No mention of publication place and name of the publisher).

Juste, María G.; Ramírez, Ana; Barbadillo, Patricia 1991.
Actitudes y Opiniones de los Españoles ante la Infancia.
Madrid: Centro de Investigaciones Sociológicas.

Madrid: Instituto de la Juventud.


Pérez, Petra M.; Marín, Ricardo; Vázquez, Gonzalo 1993. Los


Proyecto Estela 1998. Guía para identificar el desarrollo de buenas prácticas (No mention of publication place and name of the publisher).


Tobío, Constanza 1995. 'Formas de Supervivencia de las Familias: La Posición de las Familias en la Estructura Social' In


Valiente, Celia 1996a. 'Men's Family Roles in Post-authoritarian Spain' In Men's Family Relations Ed. by Ulla Björnberg and Anna-Karin Kollind, 11-32. Stockholm and Gothenburg: Almqvist & Wiksell and Gothenburg University.


Valiente, Celia 1998-1999. 'Feminismo de Estado en los Ayuntamientos de la Comunidad Autónoma de Madrid' Gestión y