Title: Gender Impact Assessment & the Employment Strategy in Germany
Country: Germany
Author(s): Friederike Maier

Copyright Disclaimer: This report was produced as part of the work of the European Commission’s Expert Group on Gender and Employment (EGGE) and was funded by the European Commission. The European Commission has granted permission for this report to be published in this website. The opinions and views expressed in this report remain the responsibility of the authors and authors alone, and should not be taken to be representative of the views of the European Commission.
Part II of the National Report for EGGE
Gender Impact Assessment and the Employment Strategy

Draft

– Please do not publish or hand out to others than the EU and the EGGE -
- - English not edited

Friederike Maier
Germany
Berlin, November 2000
Content

1. Gender Impact Assessment – State of the art

1.1 guidelines already issued or currently developed
   focused on government policy (Federal, Länder and local level) and trade unions

1.2 evaluation /gender impact assessment of employment policies
   focused on Federal employment office

1.3 general remarks

2. Gender Impact Assessment of Employment Measures

2.1 Active labour market programmes

2.2 Promotion of IT-employment/training
1. Gender Impact Assessment – State of the art

Gender mainstreaming in different policy areas like welfare state policy, family policy, employment policy or educational policy is a subject of animated discussion in Germany. At present, a variety of initiatives, different interpretations and concepts of what is meant by gender mainstreaming are under debate (see for example Stiegler 2000, Töns/Young 2000, Helferich 1999, Lipinsky 1999, Schunter-Kleemann 1998, Stiegler 1998, Projekt Weltkonferenzen 1998). It is therefore quite difficult to develop an overall assessment of the influence of gender mainstreaming and the development of gender impact assessments on labour market and employment policy on the federal, regional and local level and on the different actors in employment policy: the governments in the different areas, the social partners and the employment services. There are currently a number of interesting projects that could eventually enhance the process of implementing gender mainstreaming and develop gender impact assessment criteria and procedures. However, most of the programmes and measures are in the initial phase and need time to develop. The following section is therefore a first attempt without full coverage of all possible fields. I divided the section into several levels of actors: (federal, Länder and local) governments, the employment service and the social partners – as the implementation of employment policies is a highly diversified affair involving these different levels and actors.

1.1 guidelines already issued or currently developed

Federal Government: After coming to power in fall 1998 the new government has developed a number of initiatives to adopt and promote the EU concept of gender mainstreaming. The Ministry for Family, Seniors, Women and Youth (BMFSFJ) is mostly held responsible for advancing the process of gender mainstreaming throughout the federal administration and decision making process. Part of the programme “women and work” is the establishment of an inter-ministerial working group. Since May 2000 the state-secretaries of the Federal ministries meet on a regular basis to develop more concrete concepts for the integration of gender mainstreaming into all levels of government. Additionally, all heads of the departments of all federal ministries undergo gender training in order to learn how to
apply the gender aspects to their work. Furthermore the BMFSFJ initiated the reform of the common standing orders under the aim to guarantee the political commitment to implement gender mainstreaming in all government actions. The common standing orders of all federal ministries are revised since the 26th of July 2000 and §2 states now that gender equality is a main aim of government policy (Wenner 2000b). The new standing orders include the obligation of developing and introducing a gender impact assessment procedure in all legal actions of the government. The BMFSFJ has suggested to add a catalogue of concrete criteria specifying how the government will integrate gender-sensitive issues into its current work and future projects and a frequent evaluation of all future amendments under gender criteria should be guaranteed (for details see Töns/Young 2000). These criteria or guidelines are not yet developed or part of work – it is just the beginning of the process.

Länder Level: concerning employment strategies, especially the implementation of European Social and Structural fund policies, the Länder play a major role as they control the concrete measures and programmes. Germany has 17 Länder; each of them has its own philosophy and strategy in coping with the gender-mainstreaming concept. Since the European Programmes demand the development of a gender-mainstreaming concept, and are putting pressure on the Länder administrations, the debate and concepts are now becoming more concrete. Some of the Länder already developed gender-mainstreaming concepts. Saxony-Anhalt is one of the first Länder to introduce a change in gender policy: since May 2000 the government has integrated gender mainstreaming into its common standing orders. This decision includes a concept for a detailed outline of goals, the necessity of a two track strategy for the implementation (responsible are both the Ministry for Labour, Women, Health and Social Affairs and all departments of all other ministries in which the concrete programme is allocated) and includes the commitment at the highest level of government. It gives further information about specific instruments of implementation, such as guidelines on expert training, monitoring and controlling (gender impact assessment). In Lower-Saxony a similar concept has been decided by the government, first projects of single departments are under development and will be accompanied by gender training for the employees in the relevant departments (Stiegler 2000). Other Länder, like Schleswig-Holstein or Berlin are in the process of developing gender impact assessment and controlling procedures
concerning employment policies and especially the European Programmes. In most Länder the European Programmes are the initial impulses to develop gender mainstreaming ideas and procedures. One example is found in Northrhine-Westfalia: in the target 2 programmes of the European Structural Foudns Northrhine Westfalia has defined four priorities: financing of new enterprises, development of new enterprises, development of local and regional infrastructure and integration into the employment system. A number of concrete programmes have to be developed under each of the priorities. Women's employment is integrated into the priority “integration into the employment system” and has to be integrated into all other priorities and programmes/measures. The government has hired a consulting firm called “Zentrum Frau in Beruf und Technik” which has the task to enact the gender mainstreaming and gender impact assessment by conducting the following steps:
- development of criteria for gender mainstreaming – this means the development of adequate indicators concerning women's participation in resources and results of the programmes (input and output related indicators), evaluation of already existing lists/sets of indicators from other countries or Länder, development of manuals and checklists concerning gender impact assessment
- organising the dissemination and transfers of the information/concepts i.e. organising gender mainstreaming training and other seminars
- transfers of concepts especially into small and medium sized enterprises
The Zentrum announces a close co-operation with firms, chambers of commerce and industry, trade unions, local employment offices, organisations of further training, women's groups and other local actors (information on: http://www.zfbt.de/chance.htm, September 2000).
Other Länder develop similar initiatives – the European Programmes give an incentive to develop such initiatives. Among experts it is clear that without the European strategy there would be no progress in gender mainstreaming in Germany. The main resistance against the approach (and against the development of concrete indicators and evaluation procedures) is still found in the Ministries of Economic Affairs, including the departments being responsible for the EFRE programmes.

**Local Governments:** Some practical examples for gender mainstreaming and assessment is found at the local town level. For example: the Ministry of Interior in the Land Schleswig-Holstein has recently sponsored a project on gender
mainstreaming conducted in two Northern towns Lübeck and Norderstedt. The project demonstrated how gender mainstreaming could be implemented in various local policy fields, among them labour market policy. The methods of mainstreaming included a definition of targets, an operationalisation of the targets into indicators/benchmarks and checklists, the definition of new responsibilities in following the implementation process and the controlling of results. The procedures of reporting and evaluation are made quite concrete; the necessities of data/statistics are defined and had been submitted to the relevant statistical offices at local level (Hansestadt Lübeck and Stadt Norderstedt 1999).

- Gender mainstreaming as part of new public management

The introduction of the gender mainstreaming into local administrative action in Lübeck and Norderstedt has been part of a project concerning the development of modern government administrative structures and implementation processes. However, New Public Management is a topic/issue in all levels of the German administration and the development of benchmarking processes, of target definitions in public administration, of steering and regulation procedures by incentives etc. is a quite recent development. The necessity of administrative reforms and new methods of public management are widely accepted and lead to a variety of projects and reforms. Sometimes these reforms include gender mainstreaming, sometimes they counteract it (for example when output indicators are not related to gender differences).

**Trade unions**: gender mainstreaming as a concepts within trade union activities had been first integrated in the policy guidelines of the trade union of the public sector employees (ÖTV) in 1998. The main focus of gender mainstreaming should be put on collective bargaining, i.e. wage policy and working time policy. Other trade unions followed very slowly. The concept of gender mainstreaming is not yet represented in the organisational structures and decision-making procedures of the trade unions – the tradition of women's representatives is still alive (and these women have to take care for all policy areas and are therefore already mainstreamed). The lack of agreed concepts and policy recommendations is rather negative, as trade union representatives form part of the tripartite body of the Employment Offices at all levels. Only some regional unions have developed ideas and concepts of gender
mainstreaming in the regional/local employment policy (see examples in Ziegler 2000)

1.2 evaluation /gender impact assessment of employment policy

**Federal Employment Office**: one of the most important public bodies at the federal, Länder and local level is the Federal Employment Office (Bundesanstalt für Arbeit). The Federal Employment Office is a three-partite system (government, trade unions and employers associations) under the supervision of the Ministry for Labour and Social Affairs and is responsible for the implementation of all measures of active and passive labour market policy in Germany. This means: the local employment offices implement the passive part (like unemployment assistance) and the active parts of labour market programmes (like job creation programmes, further training, and programmes for long-term unemployed). As participation in most of the active programmes is not a right of the unemployed but the aims/targets, participants and rules are defined in federal laws on one hand and filled by concrete measures on the local level (decentralisation of decision making on the regional and local level) on the other hand, the process of gender mainstreaming in this big organisation/administration is highly complex and needs a top-down strategy as well as a locally sensitive target setting and implementation strategy. The Federal Employment Office develops therefore abstract guidelines to be adapted to the particular conditions of the regional/local labour markets. For the year 2000, the concept of gender mainstreaming has been firmly integrated into the policy guidelines; the standing order 2000 of the Federal Employment Office adopts gender mainstreaming as a two-track strategy. Gender mainstreaming is integrated into the first three policy guidelines. These guidelines/targets are:

- market related development and realisation of employment possibilities
- the reduction of youth unemployment
- the reduction of long term unemployment

In all three areas gender mainstreaming is integrated in form of gender related targets.

A fourth guideline is included in the decision:

- improvements in the combination of work and family for women and men.
This guideline is the explicit gender related guideline and includes measures focused explicitly on women.
The labour offices on the Länder and local level have to put gender mainstreaming into all their measures/programmes and they have to put this last guideline into practice by providing better access to day care facilities, or flexible work schedules as well as by increasing the employability of those who wish to return to work (see Wenner 2000).
The implementation of these guidelines has to rely on an administrative structure, which is highly complex (a mixture of highly regulated administrative action and locally diversified aims, interests and groups acting quite unpredictable). Responsible for the gender policy are all units but in reality it is the central administrative unit in Nuremberg called Referat für Frauenbelange der Bundesanstalt für Arbeit (unit for women's issues). As all local and Länder units do have a similar position since 1998 (responsible for women's issues = gender mainstreaming) the administrative basis for implementation is much better than in earlier years. Since the legal base for implementing women's programmes and gender mainstreaming has been changed over the last 4 years, the BA seems to be quite advanced in the process of mainstreaming and relevant activities (see also my comments on the NAP and the Federal Employment Office)

The central administrative unit for women's issues (Referat für Frauenbelange) is quite active in implementing the policy and has published a series of concrete analysis and checklists to help local and other actors in coping with the issues.
These activities include:
A: a detailed analysis of women's employment position in present and future developments, followed by a detailed description of possible labour market programmes/measures and the relevant legal base for these actions (laws and internal decrees, decisions etc.). This paper has been presented in the internal decision making process and is published after the internal bodies agreed (Wenner/Tischer 2000).
The paper puts the emphasis on 9 relevant areas of actions:
1. General necessity of employment promotion for women
2. Improvement of the combination of work and family
3. Broadening of the occupational choice of young women and increasing women’s proportion in modern occupations with growing importance
4. Stimulation of new forms of employment and self employment of women
5. Integration of women in all programmes of active labour market policy
6. Reduction of women’s unemployment
7. Information campaigns for customers, internal employees and the public concerning women’s position and possibilities
8. Additionally to 7.: information and making sensitive of internal employees and administrative leading persons
9. Information for the tripartite bodies

The paper includes all legally binding regulations and gives hints on how to implement programmes.

B: very concrete examples on how to implement gender mainstreaming in local policy and measures have been published in early 2000. The article by Parsch-Haertel (2000) explains very detailed the concept, procedures and targets of mainstreaming and women’s issues in labour market policy and gives practical examples on how to proceed and implement measures/programmes within the guidelines of the BA.

C. The Referat für Frauenbelange has published an analysis on women’s participation in active labour market policy during the year 1999. This analysis is based on the concept to analyse how women participate in programmes, how participation helped them to enter the labour market in regular employment and to discuss the targets/aims and guidelines in a gender sensitive sense, to discover disadvantages or contradictions within the legal framework and the actual policy implementation. The analysis used the newly created evaluation instruments and statistics of the BA called Eingliederungsbilanz (employment integration balance), which is thought to been an instrument of evaluation and controlling both on the local and the macrolevel of labour market policy (Tischer/Doering 2000a). The results of this analysis will be used in part II of my report.

With these activities the Federal Employment Office is on the conceptual and concrete level the most advanced actor in gender mainstreaming in employment policy.
1.3 General remarks

The examples of gender mainstreaming at the different governmental levels and in the Federal Employment Office show that there are currently a number of interesting projects and developments into the direction of gender mainstreaming and – connected with that – gender impact assessments and controlling/evaluation procedures. Despite the fact that the Federal Employment Service seems to be rather advanced, the actual practical politics on the local level are a hard struggle and not in every local office the idea of mainstreaming is just “arrived”. On the Länder and Federal Government level the guidelines of the European programmes exert a major influence and promote the creation of new guidelines, checklists gender training and give room for new administrative rules. In nearly all bodies/programmes gender mainstreaming has been part of a two-track policy, including the development of special programmes concerning women’s position. The fears of some feminist activists and scientists that gender mainstreaming will undo some of the achievements of the last 20 years, that policy will not longer focus on women as a category of discrimination, that specific equal opportunities structures and policies are not longer necessary, are not becoming true. But on the other hand it is not true, that equality is nowadays everyone’s concern – it is still the case that women’s representatives are responsible for gender mainstreaming.

An issue that needs to be addressed is the collection of gender sensitive data in order to evaluate and control the implementation of gender mainstreaming. Only two Länder in Germany have statistical laws that require gender sensitive data collection, processing and publishing. The Federal Statistic Law is gender-blind and once we need detailed data (for example wages, employment below the official part-time level, self-employment etc.) there is still a substantial lack. What is needed is not only a differentiation of data according to sex (men and women), but also according to gender roles (fathers, mothers) and household constellations (couples, children etc.).
2. Gender Impact Assessment of Employment Measures

2.1 Active labour market programmes

Reference in the NAP: Guideline 3: Transition from passive measures to active measures: “Each member state will endeavour to increase significantly the number of persons benefiting from active measures to improve their employability with a view to effective integration into the labour market. In order to increase the numbers of unemployed who are offered training or any similar measure, it will in particular fix a target, in the light of its starting situation, of gradually achieving the average of the three most successful member states, and at least 20%.”

Since German unification, labour market policy was heavily used to smoothen the breakdown of the East German labour market. Since 1994 all parts of labour market programmes had been reduced: there have been cuts in unemployment benefits, unemployment assistance, and short-time work benefits by one per cent for people with children. Active measures like training/training allowance, job creation programmes in the private and public sector etc. had been reduced, both in East and in West Germany.

Training allowance concerning unemployed participants in further training programmes has been reduced down to the level of unemployment benefits, and since 1996 training allowance is not longer a legal right for those who fulfil the eligibility criteria. Funding has been cut for training for employees who have already completed vocational training. Training is being concentrated on the long-term unemployed without vocational training and subsidies for employers who recruit long-term unemployed persons do have better conditions now than before 1996. Participants in further training do not renew their entitlements for unemployment benefits by attending training courses.

In job creation programmes which are allocated in the public sector, the private sector and very often in the third sector of charities and other non-profit organisations, wages or working times have to be reduced to 90% of the usual (collectively agreed) wage level. In December 1996 the special conditions for job creation programmes in East Germany had been phased out. The new regulations now do have the same conditions for East and West Germany, including that job
creation programmes in East Germany should be reduced to the level of West Germany. The wage subsidy paid to employers in job creation programmes is reduced to 50 to 75% of the wages to pay, only in region with unemployment rates which are 30% over the average are labour offices allowed to pay higher wage subsidies and only for the long-term-unemployed benefit receivers.

The overall spending for active programmes had been reduced during the mid-nineties as most of the budget of the employment services went to passive measures like unemployment benefits. As the calculations of the OECD show went labour market policy spending down from 1996 3,92% of the GDP to only 3,42% in 1999. Since 1998 the ratio active to passive increases which means that the relative relevance of active measures increases combined with a falling budget for overall labour market programmes. To concentrate the budget on the passive measures, which are legally, binding obligations is the automatic mechanism, because active programmes are “voluntary” programmes. Which means that their quantitative and qualitative level and financial support is depending on the political decision making on the Government level.

Women have been a target group of labour market policy since the AFG (Arbeitsförderungsgesetz) was first introduced: 1969 until 1987 paragraph 2 (5) stated that labour market policy was to support women's integration into the labour market, especially married women and women who wish to return to employment after having fulfilled family duties. The idea behind this paragraph was clearly influenced by the traditional role allocated to women and was seen to be out-dated, so it was changed in 1987. The revised formulation states that labour market policy is to help to overcome the gender-specific structure of training and employment as well as to support women's integration into the labour market. As could easily be demonstrated, women have been underrepresented in nearly all labour market programmes and activities over the past few decades, particularly in East Germany (see the detailed analysis of Henninger 2000), so that in 1993 an additional commitment was introduced to the AFG stating that women were to participate in labour market programmes in the same proportion as their proportion of the registered unemployed. The fact that this regulation is only a non-compulsory target makes it easy prey for critics who argue that it is too vague to exert a major influence on
labour offices’ implementation strategies. In the paragraph 8 of the new legal framework (SGB III) we find the same formulas again.

Despite the fact that one of the target groups of labour market policy comprises female returners and women with children, and although some regulations have been changed in favour of returners (such as the introduction of a part-time further training allowance, the option of paying for child care on behalf of participants in further training and an obligatory wage subsidy for on-the-job training if an employer hires a returner), the proportion of women in a series of labour market programmes is below their proportion of the unemployed or of those in employment both in West and in East Germany.

Latest figures on women's share in programmes are available for 1999: in West Germany the aim is not reached in all programmes except further training for adults (48.1% women). In East Germany the implementation is more successful as women's proportion could be increased in some programmes and reached the aim in job creation programmes and furthers training programmes. However, women are still underrepresented in self-employment programmes and wage subsidy programmes in private firms (see table labour market programmes).

### Proportion of Women in Employment, Unemployment and Labour Market Programmes

**West and East Germany, 1992 and 1997**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>West Germany</th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th>East Germany</th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Population (microcensus)</td>
<td>51.4</td>
<td>51.3</td>
<td>51.3</td>
<td>51.4</td>
<td>51.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Labour force (microcensus)</td>
<td>41.1</td>
<td>41.8</td>
<td>42.3</td>
<td>48.2</td>
<td>47.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Employees subject to</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- social security (June)</td>
<td>41.7</td>
<td>43.1</td>
<td>43.1</td>
<td>46.3</td>
<td>46.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>thereof: in vocational training</td>
<td>47.2</td>
<td>46.8</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>N/A</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Short-time work (annual average)</td>
<td>24.7</td>
<td>20.2</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>42.1</td>
<td>27.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Registered unemployed</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- entry into unemployment</td>
<td>42.7</td>
<td>39.9</td>
<td>41.2</td>
<td>53.5</td>
<td>44.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- annual average</td>
<td>45.7</td>
<td>42.4</td>
<td>44.3</td>
<td>63.4</td>
<td>55.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- unemployed longer than 1 year</td>
<td>47.8</td>
<td>43.7</td>
<td>44.8</td>
<td>68.9</td>
<td>68.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Recipients of unemployment benefits/assistance</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- annual average</td>
<td>40.7</td>
<td>37.0</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>65.4</td>
<td>54.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>thereof: early retirement programme (§ 105c)</td>
<td>24.8</td>
<td>26.2</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>51.0</td>
<td>47.7</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
East German early retirement programme

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Job placement (total)</th>
<th>29.7</th>
<th>47.5</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>- in employment more than 7 days</td>
<td>38.3</td>
<td>37.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- in employment less than 7 days</td>
<td>17.2</td>
<td>21.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- with financial subsidies</td>
<td>33.9</td>
<td>34.0</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Job creation programmes

| - Placements (regular/East progr.) | 33.5 | 34.6 | 34.0 | 44.4 | 57.8/4 | 53.5 |
| - Employees (annual average) (reg./East progr.) | 39.6 | 38.0 | 37.8 | 41.3 | 63.5/4 | 58.3 |

Further occup. Training

| - Participants | 42.9 | 48.1 | 49.8 | 62.0 | 60.4 | 56.1 |
| Subsidies for self-employment | 23.2 | 23.1 | 37.1 | 31.2 |
| Applicants for apprenticeships | 49.0 | 48.9 | 50.1 | 52.2 | 51.2 | 50.0 |
| - not placed by end of year | 48.8 | 51.5 | 51.6 | 53.2 | 54.8 | 53.5 |

Source: Bundesanstalt für Arbeit, ANBA several years and Tischer/Boering 2000a, p. 2315 ff.

In general: In West Germany the exclusion of women from labour market programmes results primarily from the eligibility criteria, which punish women's withdrawal from the labour market (a maximum of 6 years non-employment is allowed - in average West German women spent 8 years off the labour market), in East Germany women's exclusion is not yet a result of eligibility criteria but of sorting out processes implemented by labour offices, local training and job creation firms and employers. Nevertheless, the observation was that women's integration in labour market programmes is easier than women's integration in jobs in real private firms, i.e. regular employment. One indicator for that is that women's share in job placements is very small in East and West and leads to increasing long-term unemployment among women which is than interrupted by programme participation. The interruption by programmes decreases registered unemployment and long-term unemployment, but is only partially effective in terms of successful employment re-entering of previously unemployed persons.

The integration of gender mainstreaming in the guidelines of the Federal Employment Service and the implementation of new administrative instruments on the local and regional level, which allow a much easier control and redirecting of programmes and resources, has now changed the situation - combined with some legal changes concerning returners the situation is now much more transparent and easier to assess.
The first analysis on gender impact used the newly created evaluation instruments and statistics of the BA called Eingliederungsbilanz (employment integration balance), which is thought to been an instrument of evaluation and controlling both on the local and the macrolevel of labour market policy (Tischer/Doering 2000a). This employment integration balance is compiled for all “voluntary” labour market programmes, i.e. the active programmes, and includes information not only over the participation rates of men and women (percentages as in the table), but also over the effects of the programmes concerning the subsequent integration of the participants into the regular labour market via paid employment. The first employment integration balance was published in 1999 and included the year 1998. It was published in July 1999 and Tischer/Doering present a gender impact assessment based on these figures. The quantitative indicator concerning the participation is the above mentioned rule that women should participate to the same proportion as among the unemployed – this aim is not reached in all programmes. What is of particular relevance is the low proportion of women among all programmes, which have the aim to integrate unemployed people into a job with a (private) employer. The programmes, since 1999 counted in a separate statistical category, are shown in the following table. It includes all financial subsidies for employers hiring an unemployed person and shows only data for 1999 as the programmes had been introduced in April 1998
Programmes to support employment integration

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Programme</th>
<th>West Germany</th>
<th>East Germany</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Total number p.</td>
<td>prop. women %</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>recruitment subsidy for business start-ups</td>
<td>2861</td>
<td>40.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>integration contract</td>
<td>59</td>
<td>26.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>integration subsidy</td>
<td>21651</td>
<td>35.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>subsidy for starting a business</td>
<td>7568</td>
<td>26.1</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Tischer/Doering 2000a, p. 2315 f.

The programmes do have a quite different quantitative level, with the biggest programmes having very low female participation rates. Tischer/Doering point to the fact that women low participation in all these programmes, and in the job placement activities of the labour offices points to a weak labour market integration performance.

The employment integration balance of the different labour market programmes shows furthermore that women do have more problems to find a regular jobs after having finished the measures. Concerning all participants of further training 6 months after the end 66% of all participants had been in a job, but only 61% of the women. The same problem arose with job creation programmes: only 41% of all participants got a job, and even only 39% of all women got a job. And with the integration contracts 51% of all participants had a job after 6 months but only 41% of the women. The lower proportion of women in employment after these programmes has to analysed more precisely, because the qualitative side of the different programmes may be influential: we know that women participate in different training programmes than men, have different jobs in job creation programmes etc. – the segregated
participation concerning the concrete fields of training and employment may contribute to these results (see for analysis of former times Henninger 2000). A higher and better performance had women in some other programmes: in subsidies for taking up a business start up, women had been in employment by 89.4% of all female recipients (the overall rate was 88%), in integration subsidies 76% of all women but only 72% of all participants had a job six months after the subsidy ended (all data are taken from Tischer/Doering 2000a, p. 2313).

In general the analysis shows that women in higher age groups and long-term unemployed women had high employment integration risks, their integration rate was in all measures lower than the average rate for all women. There is a general difference in the employment integration of East and West Germany, as the lower employment growth in East Germany led to lower integration rates, especially for women. The difference between women in East and West had been greater than the differences between men in East and West leading to a persistently high proportion of long-term unemployed women in East Germany. The employment opportunities of these women are much lower than the employment opportunities of female returners. The employment integration rates of the latter had been quite high in nearly all programmes and often over the average of all women.

Although all these groups of women (returners, long-term unemployed, higher age groups, handicapped) are mentioned as special target groups of the active labour market policy (§7, Abs. 3 SGB III) the employment integration balance shows a disproportion and should enable the local labour offices to change policy and concrete actions. The Federal Employment Office has a checklist of several indicators which may help the local office to find an appropriate new strategy (see the examples in Parsch-Haertel 1999 and in Wenner/Tischer 2000).

The rules in the SGB had caused fears that the employment integration criteria could counteract women’s participation. In the comment on the 1998 NAP I therefore wrote: “The general objective to use labour market policy to promote women's opportunities in the labour market is partially counteracted by the regulation in §7 of the same law, in which all labour market programmes are bound to the criteria of “positive expectation concerning the integration in gainful employment” and that the individuals are recipients of unemployment benefits (eligibility-criteria). Both criteria serve as an exclusion of women.” This fear did not come true as there had been an internal directive not to interpret §7 regulations in the way that labour offices should be
screaming out more and less successful candidates within labour market programmes. And the eligibility criteria had been changed in favour of female returners.

However, as the employment integration balance shows, female returners are not the most vulnerable group (maybe they are younger, equipped with higher skill level and more human capital than the average female unemployed) so there should be put more attention to the long-term unemployed, higher age groups and – in general – to women in East Germany.

First results of the new instruments of gender impact assessment now being used by the Federal Employment Office are more transparency in the input and output indicators of active labour market policy, a better data base on the results of policy – what is still lacking are more detailed analysis concerning the different types of measures and programmes, the different factors influencing success and failure (like the differences in training programmes and occupational segregation etc.), a more complex analysis (see as an example Henninger 2000). But the overall procedure in the Federal employment office shows changes in a desirable direction.

2.2 Promotion of IT-employment/training

Reference in the NAP: guideline 6: Lifelong Learning:
“In order to reinforce the development of a skilled and adaptable workforce, both Member States and the social partners will endeavour to develop possibilities for lifelong learning, particularly in the fields of information and communication technologies, and each Member State will set a target according to national circumstances for participants benefiting from such measures. Easy access for older workers will be particularly important.”

Government measures (among others): 1999 start of the action programme “innovation and jobs in the information society of the 21st century”. In 2000 the Government “continues the action programme particularly to improve the parameters for accelerated utilisation of new information and communication technologies.
Emphasis is to be placed on the improvement of training and job opportunities for women (l) and their professional advancement as well as the promotion of the reconciliation of family and career for men and women” (NAP Page 22).

The overall trends in employment growth predict a growing importance of computer based work in all production and consumption industries, hand in hand with a growing importance of service activities both within the production sphere and in the service sector itself. The assumption is that Germany does not fully use the technical potential due to a lack in computer related education and training and respectably computer trained employees. Technical and organisational rationalisation and integration of computer based work into the traditional sectors like banking, insurance, in commerce/trade, public administration will reduce employment opportunities especially in lower skilled occupations and will change the content of work for the remaining employees. Other parts of the economy like Information and Communication-technologies themselves, I and C-services, Electronic Device-industries (hard –and software), multimedia development and production will grow but need highly skilled professionals with a profound knowledge in information technologies (see for details Tischer 1999, Tischer 1998, Kühlwetter 1998, Winker 1998).

Women’s starting position concerning the future development of this employment sectors are ambivalent:
- a higher proportion of women than men is already employed in occupations which have to deal with information and a higher proportion of women than men is employed in service sector industries. More employed women than men already use computers in their work. However: a relevant proportion women is employed in those sectors which will be rationalised and downsized by the faster integration of IC-technologies (2/3 of all employed women in the service sector work in the so called primary services like simple administrative and clerical work in trade/commerce, banking, insurances and in the public administration – all jobs/sectors with a high potential of rationalisation, Tischer 1999: 953))
- young women do have a higher level of general education than young men (higher proportion with completed Abitur) and since 1997 the proportion of employed women with a completed vocational training is with 54% higher than men’s proportion (51%)
– and in the late nineties women's employment growth was highly related with the higher skill/qualification level. Employment opportunities for higher skilled women will increase in the near future (and are already quite good) – especially in services like information services, general counselling and consulting, advisory services, training services, marketing, sales activities etc. but also in computer-based areas like multimedia services, organisational and technical counselling and consulting, research and development and in technical occupations (see Engelbrech 2000). However, there are two risks:

- firstly a high risk for all low skilled or unskilled female (and male) employees in nearly all sectors of production and services, due to the rationalisation processes and processes of upgrading skills in the remaining jobs (not necessarily connected with the upgrading of wages. see the example of secretarial jobs). Even now the labour force participation rate and the employment rate of low skilled women are significantly lower than for high skilled women and the unemployment rates of unskilled or semiskilled women are substantially higher than for skilled women and unskilled men (see Tischer/Doering 2000b).

- Secondly: most of the potential growth areas are until now male dominated occupations and jobs (highly segregated like computer technologies or middle segregated like media experts and consulting firms) with – like in the pure information technologies – a falling proportion of female students/employees. Women's integration in the IC technologies is based on the fact that women use computers in their work but do not develop computers (neither hard- nor software), do not develop multi-media etc.(see Tischer 1999). The NAP 2000 included a table on women's proportion in the IT and Media Occupations being trained within the dual system (the creation of these new occupations within the German apprenticeship system was one of the main changes in the apprenticeship system during the last years).
## Apprentices in IT and Media Occupations 1997 and 1998, by gender

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>trainees 1997</th>
<th>of those female</th>
<th>trainees 1998</th>
<th>of those female</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>number</td>
<td>number</td>
<td>percent</td>
<td>number</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Film and video editor</td>
<td>36</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>55 %</td>
<td>57</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Media designer (video and audio)</td>
<td>500</td>
<td>139</td>
<td>28 %</td>
<td>965</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Graphic master producer for</td>
<td>1,707</td>
<td>964</td>
<td>56 %</td>
<td>1,528</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>advertising and media</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Specialized computer scientist</td>
<td>1,800</td>
<td>217</td>
<td>12 %</td>
<td>5,635</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Informatics clerk</td>
<td>772</td>
<td>185</td>
<td>24 %</td>
<td>2,193</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Information and telecommunication</td>
<td>1,485</td>
<td>68</td>
<td>5 %</td>
<td>3,651</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>systems electronic</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Media and information services</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>540</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>specialist (public service)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Media and information services</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>33</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>specialist (industry and commerce)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Audio-visual media clerk</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>269</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Media designer for digital and print</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>2,602</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>media</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

This table shows that these 10 new occupations are divided into 3 highly segregated male jobs (specialised computer scientist (? – I would translate the German word Fachinformatiker with specialised computer operator...), women's proportion 11% in 1998; information and telecommunications systems electronics, women's proportion 4% - these two occupations are core occupations in IT and have the highest number of apprentices; the third male dominated occupations is information clerks: it is an administration occupation and has a female proportion of 23%), 1 highly segregated female job: media and information services specialist in the public services. This occupation has in contrast to the similar occupation in the private sector only 10% male apprentices – in the private sector the similar occupation is mixed with a proportion of 66% women. Why the apprentices in the public services are predominantly female is not clear – one explanation could be that wages for IT-occupations in the public sector are much lower than in the private sector, another explanation could be that mainstreaming policy had first effects in the public sector recruiting policies and good training had been offered to young women instead of young men...

The remaining other 6 occupations are more or less mixed occupations concerning the apprentices.

IT occupations which are based on a university or polytechnic education are found in technical or business engineering, in information sciences or computer sciences or applied natural sciences like business mathematics. Women's proportion among the students of the relevant subjects is below 20% . with small variations among hard core subjects like electronics (less than 4% women) and information technologies with 17% women). Whereas women's low proportion in all technical and engineering studies has a long and difficult to change tradition, was women's proportion in information sciences quite high, when the studies had been created at universities and polytechnics. The establishment of the occupation as major occupational field and the sex-stereotyping went hand in hand (we described this observation already in the segregation report in 1992).

Given this background, a programme called “innovation and jobs in the information society of the 21st century” which aims to be gender neutral or even oriented towards women's advancement needs to take care of the following points (these points/criteria has been discussed and published by a group called “women in the
information society” which is financed via the programme, see Arbeitsgruppe Frauen in der Informationsgesellschaft 1999, Winker 2000). The group pointed to the following issues:

- necessary is a higher participation of women in the shaping of the information society: this needs programmes to open up internet facilities for all parts of the society, counselling activities in using the new media, especially addressed to women. A major point are unskilled or semiskilled women, women with a low income and women with a certain distance to training or learning activities. The IT-components in general education, in schools and universities in general and in highly segregated women’s occupations in traditional fields need to be strengthened and upgraded. The aim of strengthening women’s competence in IT-matters should be followed by women's only classes and training components.

- necessary is the integration of women into the core IT-occupations (desegregation of male dominated occupations) which could be supported by better information campaigns (by the Government, professional organisations, social partners etc.), integration of women in training activities of the employment service, summer-universities for women in information and engineering studies. Necessary are programmes in creating special incentives for training institutions and employers to increase women's proportion among students and employees.

- as the spread of IT-components and jobs will increase the erosion of the “standard employment relationship” by creating a variety of new forms of employment (self-employment, pseudo-self-employment, teleworking, part-time arrangement without social security coverage etc.) new initiatives in the field of new forms of employment are necessary, i.e. models of new forms of working time arrangements, family related forms of teleworking, incentives for new firms founded by women etc.

- as the use of new technologies and the problems of employment and training opportunities of low skilled and semi skilled persons are not adequately covered by ongoing research, an increase of research activities in these fields is needed.

The programme of the Government covers a whole range of activities and aims and has a set of more or less concrete targets (quota/proportions to be reached). In analysing the gender aspects of the programme it is remarkable that the idea of gender mainstreaming and women's activities is integrated into nearly all parts of the programme. The values and norms expressed by the programme are such that all
social groups need to be integrated in the information society and therefore the programme intends to strengthen the social and employment equality of men and women. By using the female potentials and high skills of women Germany will increase its position in the world market. These general remarks attribute a positive value to women's employment in the IT sector and reflect a slightly new, and positive approach towards female employment in general.

Explicitly formulated are targets like the increase in women's proportion among apprentices in IT occupations (until 2005: 40%) and among students in information sciences (until 2005 new entrants: 40% women), an action called “women on the web” (see example best practice in the NAP 2000, the target is 50% internet-users are female in 2005, until now the proportion is 30%), the increase of female self-employed respectively business start-ups from today 30% to 40% in the years to come.

These concrete targets are accompanied by a set of measures and activities involving different actors in the field: the Federal Ministries for Economics, for Education and Research, for Family, Seniors, Women and Youth act as financial supporters and initiate different activities, the social partners and professional organisations are participating in concrete programmes like the information campaigns. Universities, schools and other training institutions are offered money for special efforts to integrate new media and IT in the curriculum; the amount of money is higher once they integrate women into the courses. Certain parts of the budgets are bound to women's only courses, or training activities, for other parts the institutions have to fulfil the requirement that 40% of the budget is given to women, or that 40% of the participants are women etc. The Federal employment service and its local branches are enabled to initiate local alliances for IT-jobs, the number of further training places in IT is increased from 30.000 per year to 35.000 in the next three years.

As the programme was started in 1999, it is too early for a concrete evaluation of the measures, the overall effects are not yet visible. The parts which had been already implemented like Women on the web had been quite successful and reached their aims (see NAP, English version p.59). The financial resources attributed to these programmes are not very high, but they exert an influence on the behaviour of individual actors like universities, training institutions etc.
Two crucial points are still not solved: how to influence the gender-segregation in the IT-occupations on the level of private firms (as the concrete decision for an apprentice is taken in the firms) and how to integrate employed but low skilled women in services or production sectors into training activities, proactive policies before the jobs are gone and the women are unemployed. Another contradictory development: Germany started a campaign to recruit IT-specialists from abroad. A so called “Green Card” would allow employers to hire a non-EU specialist for a period of 5 years, irrespective of the general stop of legal immigration. The demanded wage-level to allow the Green card is rather high (80,000 DM per year). After a campaign of nearly 6 months neither the supply of highly skilled foreigners is as high as expected, nor is the demand by the employers side. Although the debate about this IT-specialists was gender-neutral (in fact the films in TV always showed Indian women working with computers), the public notion and the connotation of IT-specialist was highly male-dominated. This debate may counteract the Governments mainstreaming approach in the IT-occupations as it demonstrates that not only women are a potential labour force but also people from outside Germany.

Conclusion: the IT-Programme of the Government integrates gender issues and measures related to women’s advancement to a higher degree than ever conceptualised. It takes a positive approach towards women’s employment and creates financial incentives to implement measures that will help to reach the targets. The targets are ambitious with respect to the starting point, the financial resources attributed are limited but in special areas rather influential concerning the concrete action of employers, universities, training institutions,
Literature


Hansestadt Lübeck and Stadt Norderstedt (1999), Projekt Steuerung von Querschnittszielen am Beispiel der Gleichstellung von Frauen und Männern, Norderstedt


Wenner, Ulrike (2000b), Umsetzung der Beschäftigungspolitischen Leitlinien, internes Manuskript Nürnberg, September 2000

Wenner, Ulrike, Tischer, Ute (2000), Zukunftsoorientierte Arbeitsmarktpolitik zur Förderung der gleichberechtigten Teilhabe von Frauen am Arbeitsmarkt, in:
Informationen für die Beratungs- und Vermittlungsdienste (ibv), No. 22, 31.5.2000, Nürnberg, S. 2299 – 2308

