EGGE – EC’s Expert Group on Gender and Employment

Title: Gender Mainstreaming In The Spanish National Action Plan 2000

Country: Spain

Authors: María Luisa Moltó and Celia Valiente

Copyright Disclaimer: This report was produced as part of the work of the European Commission’s Expert Group on Gender and Employment (EGGE) and was funded by the European Commission. The European Commission has granted permission for this report to be published in this website. The opinions and views expressed in this report remain the responsibility of the authors and authors alone, and should not be taken to be representative of the views of the European Commission.
Summary

Executive summary

1. Identifying the gender equality deficit and the need for action. 1
   1.1. Cyclical and secular employment and unemployment trends. 1
   1.2. Preconditions for gender equality in the labour market. 2
       Care support infrastructure. 2
       Social protection, tax and benefits. 3
       Involvement of women in decision making. 4
   1.3. Job creation and gender segregation. 5
       Impact of sectoral restructuring on employment and unemployment trends. 5
       Access of women to new job areas and higher level jobs. 5
       Job satisfaction and quality of employment opportunities. 6
   1.4. The need for action on equal opportunities. 7
       Identification of key groups of women. 7
       Gender impact of active labour market policy. 7

2. Assessing the Implementation of Gender Mainstreaming. 8
   2.1. Monitoring and evaluation. 9
   2.2. Initiatives to promote gender equality. 11
   2.3. Coherence and consistency in the gender mainstreaming approach. 13
   2.4. Mechanisms for implementing gender mainstreaming. 14

3. Assessing the priority accorded to gender equality. 14
   3.1. Assessment of pillar 4 of the Spanish 2000 NAP. 15
   3.2. Assessment of the priority accorded to gender equality in the whole 2000 NAP (and not only in pillar 4). 17

4. Priority areas for future action and identification of best practice. 19
   4.1. Priority areas for future action. 19
   4.2. Examples of best practice. 20

References. 22

Appendix

Graphs

Tables
Executive summary

In cross-national comparative terms, the Spanish labor market is characterized by: low levels of activity and employment; a high prevalence of temporary employment; a limited diffusion of part-time work; and high levels of unemployment. In the fourth quarter of 1998, the male activity rate was 63%, while the female rate was 38%. In the fourth quarter of 1999, approximately 3 out of 10 women over 16 were in employment, in comparison to more than 1 man out of every 2. Both women and men have a high share in temporary contracts: more than 1 out of every 4 women and less than 2 out of every 8 men were on temporary contracts in the fourth quarter of 1999. In 1998, part-time works accounted for 17% of female employment, 3% of male employment, and 8% of total employment. The unemployment rate is still the highest in the EU. Even if it is decreasing for both women and men, in the 4th quarter of 1999, the female unemployment rate was 22.4%, while the male unemployment rate was 10.8%, in comparison with 27% and 13%, respectively in 1998.

The Spanish welfare state, as any other of continental type, only facilitates the participation of women in the labor market to a limited extent, because the welfare state is heavily transfer-oriented and offers very few social services. Regarding the involvement of women in political decision making, Spain occupies a middle position in the EU. Twenty eight percent of the seats in lower chamber of the Spanish parliament and 23% of the upper house are occupied by women.

The Spanish 2000 NAP is very weak regarding gender mainstreaming (the inclusion of a gender equality perspective in the formulation, implementation and evaluation of any public policy directed to women and men). Rather, in an attempt to strength equal opportunities for women and men in the labour market, the Spanish 2000 plan contains measures directed to women. These policies for working women are included mainly in pillar 4. An assessment drawn from a comparison of the present NAP with NAPs from previous years is that women are becoming increasingly invisible in the general objectives of the plan. While the gender dimension appeared from the very beginning of the 1998 NAP in the introduction, crossing over all the pillars, women seem to be disappeared in the present NAP, and they are only implicitly referred to as a collective in need of help.

The Spanish 2000 NAP does not describe in detail any method for evaluating its gender equality impact during and/or after its implementation. The areas related to part-time work, and parental and other family-related leaves are sections (among others) where the Spanish 2000 NAP does not fulfil the minimum requirement for gender mainstreaming, that of ensuring that new policies and initiatives are not likely to exacerbate gender gaps. The Spanish 2000 NAP contains objectives and measures which are at best likely not to increase gender inequalities, that is, they conform to a defensive definition of mainstreaming. One of these policies is the promotion of training. Following the Council recommendations of 14th February 2000 (Comisión Europea, 2000), the Spanish 2000 NAP contains goals and initiatives within the first three pillars which are potentially consistent with a proactive approach to gender mainstreaming, for example, the objective of increasing the participation in the labor market of the population of working age.

With respect to pillar 4, the content of its policies mainly consists of: measures to help women combine family and professional responsibilities; affirmative actions of pilot nature (which affect a low number of beneficiaries and imply low costs); and training. It is hardly ever said whose political and/or social actor is going to be in charge of which specific measure. Vagueness characterize most of the measures of pillar 4. In comparison with pillar 1, 2, and 3, pillar 4 is the least important pillar of the plan. As for the size of the employment-policy related budget devoted to gender equality and gender mainstreaming measures, we need to stress first that an effort has been done in the 2000 NAP, in comparison with previous NAPs, in the presentation and clarification of the budget allocated to the fourth pillar. This is remarkable when we compare with other pillars, which make a fragmentary presentation by guidelines, and the total budget that does not even appear in the plan. The Women's Institute has made the compilation of the information, both the budget for the year 2000 and the expenditure of 1999. As far was we know from the available
information, even if the share of the total budget devoted to the fourth pillar in only 0.7% in year 2000, it has increased from an insignificant share of 0.1% in the previous year 1999. The increase of this share parallels the increase of the total budget from 6,611 ECU in 1999 to 16,159 ECU in year 2000. It is also remarkable that the relative variation has been much higher in the fourth pillar than in the total budget (1223.7% in comparison with 144.4%), despite the low level of departure.

Hardly any general target is dissagregated by gender in the Spanish 2000 NAP, while the overwhelming majority of equal employment policies are directed to women. If we compare the NAPs, we hardly see new policies and initiatives in the 2000 NAP. The Spanish 2000 NAP makes only very few, very vague and passing references to the establishment of a care infrastructure. The establishment of a care infrastructure is an example of a 'flanking' measure to provide the appropriate background for the implementation of gender equality measures in employment.

We identify priority areas for future action with respect to (i) policies; (ii) monitoring and evaluation; and (iii) processes. (i) Regarding policies, we recommend that future NAPs make women more visible, especially in the general objectives of the plan and across all pillars (and not only regarding pillar 4). Future plans should allocate a higher share of the budget to equality between women and men. A stronger effort on gender mainstreaming is our second advice. We advocate the elaboration of policies for women in combination with gender mainstreaming. One of the aims of gender equality policies in future plans will have to continue to be the increase of women's participation in the labour market. Nevertheless, once in employment, women face barriers against gender equality that need to be addressed in future NAPs, including (among others): horizontal segregation, discrimination in promotion, and sexual harassment in the work place. The identification of the actors involved in the implementation of concrete measures has to be undertaken in future plans.

(ii) With respect to monitoring and evaluation, future NAPs will have to describe in detail methods for assessing the gender impact of NAPs during and after its implementation.

(iii) As regards processes, we propose to include women and women's organizations in the elaboration, implementation and evaluation of gender equality measures. We also advise to attempt to obtain the involvement in the elaboration and implementation of gender equality measures of economic, social and political actors usually absent in this policy area.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>OBJECTIVES</th>
<th>List of Measures in 2000 NAP</th>
<th>(i)</th>
<th>(ii)</th>
<th>(iii)</th>
<th>(iv)</th>
<th>(v)</th>
<th>(vi)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Employment promotion (job creation etc)</td>
<td>Program of Employment Promotion (Social security rebates for at least 12 months for first hiring of women on permanent contracts: younger than 30 (up to 25%), long-term unemployed (up to 60%), older than 45 (up to 60%) (More information in Annex IV and guideline 10) Promotion of local development of employment in neighborhood services of caring children and old people (guideline 12)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td><em>X</em></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tax and benefit system (incentives for participation etc)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td><em>X</em></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Measures for the employed</td>
<td>On-the-job-training for the employed, preferentially for workers most likely to be expelled from the labour market, such as women (guidelines 5,6,7 and 8).</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td><em>X</em></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Measures for the unemployed</td>
<td>Women will participate in insertion measures according to their numerical presence among the unemployed, where they represent 61.1% (guidelines 1 and 2).</td>
<td><em>X</em></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td><em>X</em></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Measures for the inactive and returners</td>
<td>Training for women returners in rural and urban areas (guideline 21) To encourage that workers on parental leave and other family leaves participate in training programs (guideline 8)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td><em>X</em></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Entrepreneurship</td>
<td>Financial assistance and training for women entrepreneurs (300 million pesetas will be spent on giving orientation and support to 720 female employers) (guideline 19)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td><em>X</em></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Adaptability</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gender mainstreaming</td>
<td>Design of a plan of dissemination of information to firms of all the subsidies to hire women (guideline 18).</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td><em>X</em></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Desegregation</strong></td>
<td>Training of women in new technologies to facilitate occupational diversification (guideline 19). Incentives will be given to permanent contracts of unemployed women hired in occupations where they are under-represented (guideline 19).</td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Pay</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Parental leave</strong></td>
<td>Development of the law of conciliation of family and professional life, with special attention to parental leave (guideline 20)</td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Care (children, elderly, other)</strong></td>
<td>Promotion of public creches in collaboration with local governments and municipalities (guideline 20)</td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Other family friendly measures</strong></td>
<td>To foster the creation of services publicly subsidized to support families: home help, and day and night centers (guideline 20)</td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

(i) gender impact taken into account in the design  
(ii) aimed at improving the process of gender mainstreaming  
(iii) monitored for gender impact  
(iv) aimed at closing gender gaps  
(v) aimed at improving the reconciliation of work and family life  
(vi) aimed at allowing women and men to return to the labour market
1. Identifying the gender equality deficit and the need for action.

1.1. Cyclical and secular employment trends.

In cross-national comparative terms, the Spanish labour market is characterised by: low levels of activity and employment; a high prevalence of temporary employment; a limited diffusion of part-time work; a high proportion of self-employment; and high levels of unemployment. Important gender gaps exist in most of the aforementioned dimensions of the labour market.

According to the EC report Employment in Europe 1999, employment in Spain grew over 3% a year during the recovery period 1994-1998, with a rate of productivity rise close to zero and GDP growth around the EU average. However, Spain was not successful in reducing unemployment, partly because of the large rise in female participation, with a prevailing low rate. The annual change in employment was also higher for women (around 4%) than it was for men (around 2.5%) in those years. However, the unemployment rate for women still duplicates the rate for men, even if both were declining in 1996, 1997 and 1998, but also at a much higher rate for men (-1.7%, -8.3% and -13.7%) than for women (-0.7%, -2.3% and -4.4%).

According to national data (EPA, Labour Force Survey), neither participation nor employment of women are subject to cyclical effects to the same extent as men are (Graphs 1 and 2). Activity and employment rates in the long run both show a positive trend for women 25 and older, and a decreasing trend in the case of men (Graph 3).

The most recent data show that approximately 3 out of ten women over 16 were in employment in the 4th quarter 1999, in comparison to more than 1 men out of every two, the employment rate increase doubling for women (Table 1). In the fourth quarter of 1998, there was still a pronounced gender gap regarding activity, since the male activity rate was 63%, while the female rate was 38%, the gender gap existing in all age groups (Table 2). The former pattern of most women leaving the labour market (if ever present there) when they got married or had the first child has been reversed, since currently many women remain in the labour force after marriage or the first delivery. Even if the activity rate of married women (36%) was lower than that of women who are single (52%) or separated or divorced (71%), nevertheless, the majority of married women aged 44 or under were active (Table 3). Then, at the age at which most Spanish women have completed their reproductive period, the majority of them remained in the labour force. The group of women 40 to 60 years old have experienced the highest growth rates in their participation.

There is also a considerable gap between women and men regarding employment. In 1998, the male employment rate was 25 percentage points higher than the female employment rate (28%), the gender gap in employment rates existing for all age groups (Table 4), even if the highest rate of increase in 1996, 1997 and 1998 for female employment was in the 50-54 age group (5.9%, 10.3% and 7.2%, respectively). Gender differences in unemployment rates were also considerable, since the female unemployment rate was (27%), while the male unemployment rate was (13%), the gender gap existing for all age groups (except for people aged 60 and over) (Table 5). Moreover, Spanish women were over-represented among those suffering the worst types of unemployment: those unemployed for long periods, and those who are first-time job seekers. 54% of unemployed women aged 15-64 years (and 44% of unemployed men aged 15-64 years) have been unemployed for twelve months or more. 29% of unemployed women (and 20% of unemployed men) were first-time job seekers. It is important to note that education does not prevent women from high unemployment rates, as it does indeed in relation to labour market participation (the group of women with university degrees has been registering the
highest growth rates in activity, at approximately 9% increase per year between 1995 and 1998). In fact, the unemployment rate for women with university degrees still doubles the male rate (Table 6), while the activity rate is over 80% (Moltó, 1998).

1.2. Preconditions for gender equality in the labour market.

Care support infrastructure

The Spanish welfare state, as any other of continental type, only facilitates the participation of women in the labour force to a limited extent, because the welfare state is heavily transfer-oriented and offers very few social services (Esping-Andersen, 1990, 1999).

Parents receive modest aid from the state for children under six (when mandatory school starts):\(^1\) paid maternity leave and non-paid parental leave as a substitute rather than as a complement to child care; hardly any child care services for children aged two or under; means-tested child allowances; and low tax exceptions for dependent children. The main exception to this general rule is the relatively generous supply of pre-school services for three-, four- and five-year-old children.

As for paid-maternity leave, working mothers who have been previously employed and have contributed to the social security system at least 180 days within the 5 years previous to child birth are entitled to 16 uninterrupted weeks of paid leave. The number of years contributed and the level of contribution (which is proportional to the salary) are used to calculate the so-called regulatory base (base reguladora). The amount received during parental leave is 100% of the regulatory base. The right to return to the job is guaranteed. Since 1989, if both parents perform waged work the father may take up to four of the final weeks of the leave (in this case the mother must return to work). In 1999, Act 39 of 5 November on conciliation of workers' family and professional life increased the number of weeks of father's leave from 4 to 10, which can be simultaneously with the mother's leave\(^2\). The number of fathers who take maternity leave is insignificant. According to the Spanish Labour Force Survey (Encuesta de Población Activa), in the fourth quarter of 1998, 97% of waged workers who did not work due to maternity leave were women, and the remaining 3% were men (Instituto Nacional de Estadística, 1999a:204), while in 1999 this percentage was 0 (Table 7). There is also provision for up to three years of non-paid parental leave for working mothers or fathers. Return to the job is only guaranteed during the first year. The right to a job in the same professional category is guaranteed during the second and third years. The period of leave is counted as effectively worked in terms of seniority. The fact that after these leaves working women receive hardly any help from the state to combine family and work responsibilities means that in Spain maternity and parental leaves are a substitute and not a complement to child care.

The main policies for children under six are educational pre-school programs for children aged four or over. In the academic year 1996-1997 the percentage of children who attended public pre-school programs was: 43 for 3 years old children; 70 for 5 years old children; and 70 for 4 years old children. The extension of such programs is quite high in comparative terms. In contrast, the percentage of children aged 2 or under cared for in public centers was very low (2.5) (Table 8). It also shows that only 3.5% of children aged 2 or under are taken cared for in private centers either. It should be stressed

\(^1\) This has also been the conclusion of comparative research on support for children. See, for instance, Bradshaw et al. (1993).

\(^2\) This Act also develops a new permission for caring old-age dependents.
that pre-school programs are educational programs established with the purpose of attaining equality among children from different social classes. These are not at all gender equality programs established to provide child care for working mothers (or parents). Pre-school programs cannot then be used by parents as perfect substitutes for child care, since pre-school hours are shorter than working hours (and sometimes much shorter and interrupted by a break) (Valiente, 1995). It should be remembered that in Spain most women who work for wages do so in a full-time basis.

In Spain and other Southern European countries (and probably in other countries too) families (that is, mainly women) are generally in charge of the care not only of small children, but also of any adult who, for whatever reason (e.g. illness or disability) needs the care of other people. Regarding the elderly, although they might theoretically live in centers, where they receive the care needed, in practice most of the elderly live in their homes or in the homes of their relatives but not in centers. In 1999, there were 194,952 places in old people's homes in Spain. 68,455 places (35%) corresponded to public old people's homes (data available on 6 April 2000 at http://www.seg-social.es/imserso/mayores/docs/i0_maydest0esp.html). In 1999, the ratio of places in old people's homes per 1000 elderly was 2.8 in Spain, which is one of the lowest in the EU. The EU average was approximately 5% (El País 14 February 2000:36).

Social protection, tax and benefits.

The way of access to social benefits and programmes is through the participation in the labour market or as a dependant from a participant (wife, children, etc.), the only exceptions to this rule being the health assistance and the compulsory education, which are of universal coverage. Consequently, the welfare state in Spain do not stimulate the labour force participation of women, given that most social benefits are simply monetary transfers to maintain the standard of living of certain groups of the population no longer in employment for various reasons (old age, involuntary unemployment, illness, etc.), having paid previously social security contributions as workers together with their employers (Valiente, 1998a: 63, 65).

The personal income tax that used to be on a family basis, was changed by Law 18/1991, introducing the possibility of election between individual taxation or joint taxation of the members of married couples. A new Law 40/1998 introduced in 1999 the concept of discretion income, thus deducing the basis for assessment before tax is calculated. It depends on family circumstances: in addition to the individual reduction, there is a reduction per dependent children and parents and also for dependent spouse, which is usually the female spouse, despite the increasing participation of married women in the labour market in recent years in Spain. The problem of fiscal discrimination of two earner families arises when only monetary income as the determinant of family welfare is taken into account, as it is the case in Spain. Given that one-earner families have more time for domestic production and consumption or for leisure, and given that they are not taxed, the income tax covers only monetary production and consumption. Consequently, the current fiscal regime with the option of joint taxation of the family establishes an indirect cost of participation for the inactive wife. The cost of labour market participation of the wife in Spain, was estimated to be up to 68% of the national minimum wage in 1998 (Fuenmayor and Salvador, 1999).

Involvement of women in decision making.

The participation of women in management and entrepreneurship in 1999 (31%) was near their relative participation in total employment (37%). But, it is important to note that they were also over-represented in enterprises without employees (47%). Only 13% of managers in enterprises with more than 10 employees were women, this percentage amounting to 23% in the case of enterprises less than
10 employees. It is also in retail trade where women managers and entrepreneurs tend to be more present (representing 31% in small business and 55% when there are no employees (Table 9).

As for the involvement of women in political decision making, Spain occupies a middle position in the EU. The presence of women in the European Parliament is 34%. After last election (12 March 2000), 28% of seats of the lower chamber of the Spanish parliament and 23% of the upper house are occupied by women (El País 15 March 2000:27). The first proportion is the seventh highest in the EU (Interparliamentary Union, 2000 Table 10). However, the participation of women in central government is still relatively low with 14% of women ministers and a similar percentage of women general directors in 1999 (Table 11). Quite on the contrary, the participation of women in judicial power is relatively high (34%), especially among the judges were women share is as high as 55% (Table 12).

Despite the presence of women at the higher level decision making, their influence is quite limited as shown by Valiente (1998: 468-469)

“Feminists within the women’s policy machinery, unions and parties, have been very influential in the first stages of the policy-making process (problem definition and agenda setting) but not in the last stages (policy formulation and policy implementation). There influence has been mainly on problem definition.

"... They have succeeded in persuading other political actors to introduce equality goals onto their agendas. In fact, has they not been active, many state units would probably never have established equality measures, or would have established them later than they actually did. It is impossible, however, to make a similarly positive assessment of the importance of the performance of feminists in the stages of policy formulation and implementation. Specific and concrete measures to tackle various types of gender inequalities are actually formulated within the ministries and/or Parliament. Ministries in general try hard to preserve and reinforce their own powers. Feminists within the IM (Instituto de la Mujer), parties and unions have little influence in these two arenas when a choice is being made from among the various alternatives to address a problem. The implementation of gender equality measures is in the hands of state units (mainly the ministries) for which gender equality is not a priority. “.

In Spain, the conservative party governs since 1996, while the Socialist party ruled the country between 1982 and 1996. Ruiz (1999) has documented a convergence of the discourse on gender equality regarding employment. A pending question for future research is the degree of convergence of actual policies elaborated by conservative and socialist governments.

1.3. Job creation and gender segregation.

**Impact of sectoral restructuring on employment and unemployment trends.**

Women and men are employed in different proportions depending on the economic sector, socio-economic category and type of contract. As Tables 13, 14 and 15 show, women represented in the 4th quarter 1999, 48% of total employment in services, being also highly concentrated on this

---

3 We do not know of any comprehensive study in Spain on the influence of a higher proportion of female political leaders on gender equality policy making. The existence of this influence has been documented for other EU member states, for instance, Sweden (Bergqvist and Jungar, 2000; among others).

4 The presence of women in regional governments (16% in year 2000) is also lower than in regional parliaments (29%) (Instituto de la Mujer, 2000).

5 This "real" convergence seems to exist regarding the fight against sexual harassment in the work place (Valiente, 2000), although more studies are needed in order to validate this provisional conclusion. The convergence between the two parties has not taken place as for other issues: abortion and quotas (in order to increase the proportion of women in political decision making positions). The conservative party is against (and the socialist party in favor of) a more liberal abortion Act and electoral quotas (Jenson and Valiente, forthcoming).
sector. Women tend to work in the public sector to a higher extent than men (one woman out of four in comparison to one man out of seven). Other things being equal, it is probable that gender equality policies are better implemented in the public sector than in the private sector. Therefore, the over-representation of women among public employees may facilitate the implementation of measures with the explicit purpose of advancing women's status in the labour market. Both women and men have a high share in temporary contracts (more than one out of every four women and less than two out of every eight men were on temporary contracts in the 4th quarter of 1999). The main problem in this connection is the strong association with part-time employment, where women represent 80%. In fact, one out of every four women on temporary contracts worked part-time, in comparison with only one out of every eight women in the case of indefinite contracts.

The increasing employment rate of women has been mainly due to their presence in sectors in expansion. While services increased the number of women by 17.55% in the period 1993-1997, the percentage growth of women in industry was very small (2% and decreasing in agriculture (-19%). The increase in the service sector should be attributed to a favourable sector effect. Within services, there were three sectors where the increase of women was around 25%. Real state and businesses is the sector where the growth of female employment was the highest (35%). It is mostly due to the favourable sector effect, the female share effect contributing only in a small percentage (less than 10%). On the contrary, in transport and communication, with 27% growth of female employment, the share effect is clearly prevailing over the sector effect. Finally, the 25% increase of women in hotels and restaurants, is due to a sector effect. The case of public administration deserves a special comment, as even if the number of women increased by 19% over the period, the relative sector and share effects are very similar, almost at 50% (Molto, 1999:21). The occupations that contributed most to the total female employment growth of 3.3% over the period 1992-97 were technicians (2.4%), professionals (1.5%) and sales and service workers (1.4%) (Employment in Europe 1999: 94)

**Access of women to new job areas and higher level jobs.**

Even if women continue to be over-represented in clerks and sales and personal care services, they have a share of 49% among professionals (Table 16). The share of women in fast growth sectors over the period 1994-98 in the EU is relatively high in Spain (50% of total employment in business activities and 42% in hotel and restaurants were women in 1997). Similarly, we find female shares of 63% in education, but lower in wholesaling, which are medium growth sectors, while higher shares are found in slow growth and declining sectors like retail trade (55%) and public administration (35%) (Employment in Europe 1999: 90). However, within public administration, women share of civil servants was 51% in 1999. This is due to the way of access by public concourse. Nevertheless the pattern of segregation is reproduced within this employment group, with female shares over 60% in traditionally female tasks like education and health (Table 17).

The observed trend in the access of women to higher level jobs are in any case quite remarkable, as national data show. Even if the level of departure was already high in 1995, the rate of increase of women professionals was 12.1%, 6.7% and 9.8% in 1996, 1997 and 1998, respectively. The rate of increase in those years was also high in directors and managers of public administration and enterprises more than 10 employees (6.7%, 15.8% and 7.4%), but with a very low level of departure. In 1998, there were 38,600 women directors and managers against 360,900 women professionals (Anuario de Estadísticas Laborales, 1998: 91).

**Job satisfaction and quality of employment opportunities.**

According to the survey on quality of life and work (ECVT, 1999), carried out by the Spanish
Ministry of Labour and Social Affairs in 1999, 3 out of every 4 women are employees. The small percentage working as self-employed tend to work in small firms less than 10 employees (67.3% of women entrepreneurs and 92.1% of women professionals). The decision of women to stay in employment, irrespective of their family commitments is shown by the fact that only 2 out of every 10 women declared that they would leave their job for family reasons. However, a higher proportion of women (34%) than men (31%) in the sample declared that their current job was their first job offer. In addition, 6% of women versus 2% of men accepted the job offer because the working schedule was convenient. But a higher percentage of women (39%) than men (34%) also declared that never had the possibility to decide about the working time-table. Finally, 37% of women in comparison to 32% of men were indifferent or definitely not interested in their job. This is partly the consequence of the lack of valorisation of the women’s job performance by their chiefs (51.2% of women could give their opinion on job matters, but only 45% of women declared that usually their suggestions were taken into account, Table 18).

A significant part of employment expansion in the past used to be through the massive use of temporary contracts. Nowadays part-time jobs provide the strand for employment expansion.

In Spain, one out of four (25%) people who work part-time does so involuntarily. This Spanish proportion of involuntary part-time is higher than the EU average (18%). The gender gap regarding involuntary part-time employment is very small in Spain, since involuntary part-time employment as a percentage of total part-time employment is 23% for males and 25% for women (1998 Labour Force Survey:116-117). On average, salaries of part-time workers are considerably lower than those of full-time workers, according to the Survey on Salaries in Industry and Services. In 1998, the hourly salary of full-time workers was 1,571 Spanish pesetas, while that of part-time workers was 895 Spanish pesetas. Differences were more pronounced regarding monthly wages (in Spain people are usually paid monthly). In 1998, the average monthly wage was 70,364 Spanish pesetas for part-time workers and 231,561 Spanish pesetas for full-time workers (Instituto Nacional de Estadística, 1999b:160-161).6. Overall, women earned 70% of men in 1996 on an annual basis, according to the fiscal register of all the people in employment during the year with some relevant regional variation of the gender gap (Table 19). Comparable data for 1992 (women earned 73% of men) show that the gender gap has widened, despite Spanish women workers are protected by the universality of collective bargaining. In fact, the transfer of previous rules established by law to collective agreements can have contradictory effects. One possibility is to find a disproportionate negative impact on women employed in services and small firms where collective bargaining is particularly weak. In addition, a significant proportion of them are on temporary contracts with very low or no firing costs at all. However, the seniority supplement is having a lower weight, so the lower would be the gender gap, as women are over-represented among the temporary workers who do not have seniority supplements. In addition, the new regulation provides some scope for collective bargaining to establish a strategy towards abolishing wage discrimination by implementing the European Commission Memorandum on equal pay for work of equal value. In sum, given that the wage structure has been greatly simplified in the last reform, the control of discriminatory practices will be easier than it used to be before, but the creation of equality committees is urgently needed (Moltó, 1999: 36-37).

1.4. The need for action on equal opportunities.

---

6 Unfortunately, the Survey on Salaries in Industry and Services does not provide data desegregated by sex.
Identification of key groups of women.

Although the percentage of single parent families is relatively low in Spain (2.5% in 1998, according to EPA), given the low employment rate for women, it is of great concern that 90% of single parent families are headed by women. In fact, only 57% of all women single mothers were in employment compared to 74% of all men single fathers. Within all women in employment single mothers share amounted to 13.4% in comparison to only 5.4% in the case of men. Conversely, the relative weight of couples with children in the distribution of employment by family type is lower in the case of women (52%) than in the case of men (66%) (Table 20). Family organisation affects the participation and employment of women as compared to men. But also in the case of single mothers, which are mostly very young employed in unskilled jobs, living in big towns, as compared to single person households, formed very often by women 65 and older, or by women professionals of middle to high social class.

Gender impact of active labour market policy.

There has been a reorientation of employment policy through the integration of active and passive policies. In this line women become a priority group together with old age and long-term unemployed and people with disabilities (for example, in the Programme of Professional Training 1998-2000). The main change was that the programmes currently in operation were agreed by the social agents in April 1997 by reforming the general norms, restructuring the system of incentives to different contract types and introducing a reduction on layoffs on permanent contracts. It is important to note that despite women were not a target group in indefinite employment promotion contracts, a general clause in the agreement on collective bargaining, preventing any form of discrimination was established, gender discrimination specifically stated on it. To develop the commitments of the intersectoral agreement on employment stability, signed in April 1997, the Spanish government and the CCOO and UGT trade union confederations signed on 13th November 1998, an agreement on part-time employment contracts which seeks to improve the conditions of part-time workers and to provide them with social security benefits pro rata to the number of hours worked (Moltó, 1999: 30-31). In addition, the “zero cost” measure (100% subsidy of employers social security contributions on the substitution contracts, when unemployed are hired in replacement), could increase the percentage of replacements, which used to be around 10%. Unions consider that replacement contracts should be made mandatory during the leave period, given that there is an incentive for employers (De la Fuente Vázquez, 1999). The other positive action measure which was developed through a ministerial order O.M. of 16th September 1998, is the promotion of indefinite contracts for women in occupations where women are under-represented. There is a reduction up to 60% of social security contributions and also fiscal benefits for enterprises hiring women in 302 occupations of a total of 439 occupational groups included in the National Occupational Classification. It has been estimated that an employer that hires a woman in those occupations will have a significant reduction of labour the cost during two years. It has been estimated in 900 thousand pesetas (5 357 ECUS) for a woman earning 1 500 millions pesetas (8 928 ECUS) (De la Fuente, 1998c).

The participation of women in employment policies in 1998 shows that, apart from the specific measure of permanent contracts for women in male occupations, women have their highest share (84%) in substitution contracts for maternity leave. Women are over 50% in self-employment programmes, part-time permanent contracts, professional training and local employment initiatives (National Action Plan 1999).

The assessment of the 1998 action plan from the gender perspective (Moltó, 1998a, 1998b)
showed that gender inequality in the distribution of paid and unpaid work within the family and the social structure was taken for granted in the Spanish NAP. The cost of the double burden for women on part-time employment was not addressed in the EO policy. Neither it was the need to establish monetary incentives for increasing the taking-up rates of parental leave by fathers or the need to revise and update job classification, qualification and payment of jobs in new sources of social and personal services to improve the working conditions. (Moltó, 1999: 33-34).

2. Assessing the Implementation of Gender Mainstreaming

The assessment of the extent and appropriateness of gender mainstreaming within the 2000 National Action Plan (NAP) of Spain is organized in this report around four main issues:

(i) the adequacy of monitoring and evaluation procedures;
(ii) evidence of the adoption of proactive initiatives;
(iii) the consistency and coherence of the gender mainstreaming approach;
(iv) the mechanisms for implementing gender mainstreaming as a long term element in policy formation, implementation and evaluation.

Gender mainstreaming regarding employment does not consist in the elaboration of programs specifically addressed to women. Gender mainstreaming occurs when policy-makers insert a gender equality perspective in the formulation, implementation and evaluation of employment policies to be applied to men and women (Rubery, 1999). Therefore, this section 2 of the report on the assessment of gender mainstreaming focuses on pillars 1, 2 and 3 of the Spanish 2000 NAP, because these three pillars describe general employment policies directed to people of both sexes. This section does not assess pillar 4 of the Spanish 2000 NAP, because pillar 4 mainly contains employment policies explicitly addressed to women.

The first impression drawn from a comparison of the present NAP with previous years NAPS is that women are becoming increasingly invisible in the general objectives of the plan. While the gender dimension appear from the very beginning of the 1998 NAP in the introduction, crossing over all the pillars, women seem to be disappeared in the present NAP, and they are only implicitly referred to as a collective in need of help. Women as a target group are strictly restricted to pillar 4 in the Spanish 2000 NAP. We can interpret this situation as the last step of a process of policy formulation that has changed the emphasis from the acute unemployment problem of the years previous to 1997 to the current Spanish economy, which is now already established in the process of job generation. It has to be noted that the 1999 NAP represents the transition year, as women are contemplated only in the mere declaration of good intentions in the general objective. It is remarkable in this context the wording of one of the last fundamental aspects of the plan “Equality of Opportunity is a theme which runs through all the Guidelines and Pillars of the National Action Plan. This strategy has been reflected in the Spanish Government’s III Plan for Equality of Opportunities between Men and Women” (Kingdom of Spain Employment Action Plan 1999: 4). In any case, the 1999 NAP still contained approximately the same number of measures in pillars 1, 2 and 3 that were explicitly addressed to women as a target group. A rough count of those measures shows the lack of attention to women in those pillars, having diminished the number from 7 in 1998 and 1999 to only 3 in 2000. Most probably the current NAP is the logical consequence of the lack of consistency and coherence of gender mainstreaming in Spain from the very first NAP. Even if there was an important effort on gender mainstreaming, that was translated on the accent put in the gender gaps along the 1998 NAP, there has not been an in-depth analysis of necessary changes of the gender order in the Spanish society in any of the NAPs.
2.1. Monitoring and evaluation

After examining the 2000 NAP of Spain for evidence of appropriate methods for evaluating and monitoring the gender equality impacts of specific policy programs, our assessment is generally speaking negative. The Spanish 2000 NAP does not describe in detail any method for evaluating its gender equality impact during and/or after its implementation.

The Spanish 2000 NAP contains a section on the evaluation of the 1999 NAP (pages 4-11). In general, this evaluation does not monitor the gender equality impacts of the 1999 NAP. Nevertheless, this evaluation provides (very few) data disaggregated by gender on the beneficiaries of specific programs. In the sections of the document that do not deal specifically with gender equality policies (pages 4-10), the scarce data disaggregated by sex refer to pilot programs which affect a very low number of women. This is the case of the reference to:

- the Program of Employment Workshops (Programa de Talleres de Empleo). Women accounted for 56% of the 4,213 beneficiaries of this program.
- the pilot nature program called 'ALBA', which is related to the Leonardo Program, and whose aim is to foster women's employability" (page 7). The beneficiaries of the ALBA program were 300 women, and the cost of the program was of 6.4 million pesetas (page 7 of Appendix 1).
- the Plan to Support Female Employers (Plan Apoyo Mujeres Empresarias), whose beneficiaries were 740 women and whose cost was 300 million pesetas (page 9).

The exception to the rule of explicitly mentioning women only regarding pilot programs is only one reference to the fact that the beneficiaries of 59% of training initiatives for the unemployed were women (page 6). However, most of the measures for the unemployed consist just in training or guidance (where women represent 66.5%), and not mixed actions of training and employment, where the female share has only been 37.6%. The first are shorter and thus less efficient than the latter in order to place women in employment. This is particularly the case of long-term unemployed women. Similarly, the number of interventions per unemployed person has diminished from 1.7 in 1999 to only 1.4 in 2000. Once more we find again an unanticipated negative impact from the gender perspective. Concerning the unemployed, the NAP provides very general measures that do not have concrete qualitative and quantitative targets, according to the different characteristics of the unemployed, by gender. The trade unions CCOO and UGT (2000) claim that more specific and intensive active policies should be devised for the collectives most affected by unemployment (women and the young).

Surprisingly, the section of the Spanish 2000 NAP that evaluates the gender employment policies of the 1999 NAP hardly assesses the gender equality impact of these 1999 policies. This section contains some sentences, which broadly describe the situation of women in the labour market providing data of the evolution of the female activity, employment and unemployment rates in 1999 (page 10). It is then said again that 59% of training initiatives for the unemployed were directed to women (page 10). There is also a description (not an evaluation) of some 1999 gender equality programs (page 11), such as the approval of the Act of Combination of Workers' Family and Professional Responsibilities (Ley de conciliación de la vida familiar y profesional de las personas trabajadoras) (see below). Some sentences vaguely refer to positive steps for gender equality, for instance: "Female labour force statistics have been improved in order to elaborate programs that foster the employability of job seekers" (page 11). It is not said on what this improvement consists. Only in

---

7 The beneficiaries of this program are people aged 25 or over who receive training while working on services or works of public benefit between 6 and 12 months.
Appendix number 1 but not in the main text of the plan we can see (very few) statistics disaggregated by sex that truly assess the gender equality impact of the 1999 NAP, for instance, the proportion of women who benefited from different types of permanent labour contracts (page 7 of Appendix number 1). This Appendix also contains data on 1999 policies explicitly directed to women (for instance, some programs for women entrepreneurship). In sum, the 2000 Spanish NAP (to a very weak extent) evaluates some 1999 employment policies specifically addressed to women. What the 2000 NAP does not do is to assess the gender equality impact of the 1999 NAP. Generally speaking, policy evaluation is still poorly developed in Spain, and this is the case of gender equality policy (Bustelo, 1999).

Despite the fact that the main trade Unions CCOO and UGT, have repeatedly suggested the need to monitor and evaluate the results of all the measures, no significant changes appear in the 2000 NAP from previous NAP’s (CC.OO, 1999 and CC.OO and UGT, 1998). For example, the 1999 NAP established a program called “Voluntary Commitment to Activity” for the unemployed on unemployment benefit. As the proportion of women who do not qualify for unemployment benefits is considerably higher than that of men, this measure had an unanticipated negative gender impact.

2.2. Initiatives to promote gender equality

Gender mainstreaming can take either a mainly defensive approach -that is monitoring policies and programs to ensure that they do not exacerbate gender equality- or a more proactive approach where policies are promoted within the general employment program designed to reduce the gender equality deficit and to promote equal opportunities (Rubery, 1999). In this section we briefly evaluate the Spanish 2000 NAP against both criteria. We do it by identifying:

(i) first any areas where the NAP does not fulfil the minimum requirement for gender mainstreaming, that of ensuring new policies and initiatives are not likely to exacerbate gender gaps;
(ii) secondly any measures which are at best likely not to increase gender inequalities, that is they conform to a defensive definition of mainstreaming;
(iii) thirdly any initiatives, particularly those within the first three pillars, which are potentially consistent with a proactive approach to gender mainstreaming.

(i) The areas related to part-time work, and parental and other family-related leaves (among others) are the sections where the Spanish 2000 NAP does not fulfil the minimum requirement for gender mainstreaming, that of ensuring that new policies and initiatives are not likely to exacerbate gender gaps. As for part-time work, the Spanish 2000 NAP states that 73,000 of part-time jobs (and 722,000 full-time jobs) were created in 1999 (page 3). Part-time work is understood as a devise to foster job creation (page 3). The number of fixed-term part-time contracts signed in 1999 (261,287) was higher than in 1998 (147,410) (page 10). The Spanish 2000 NAP proposes to reduce 0.25 of employers' and workers' contributions to the unemployment benefit system. It is explicitly said that this reduction will apply to full-time and part-time contracts (page 21, guideline 14). The Plan recommends that collective bargaining tries to make part-time work more attractive to employers (page 22, guideline 15, guidelines 1 and 2, guidelines 5,6,7 and 8). The plan also refers to the 1998 Agreement on Part-time Work and Promotion of Its Stability (Acuerdo sobre trabajo a tiempo parcial y fomento de su estabilidad) signed on 13 November 1998 by the Government and the two main unions: the Workers' Commissions (Comisiones Obreras, CCOO); and the General Workers' Union (Unión General de

---

8 The Public Employment service and people who receive unemployment benefit will subscribe to an Agreement in which both parties accept the obligation to develop an intensive program of activities aimed at the improvement of employability, and the organisation of an active search routine (Kingdom of Spain Employment Action Plan 1999, May 1999: Guideline 4).
Finally, the Spanish 2000 NAP mentions the demand to modify the regulation of part-time employment (in the sense of a higher flexibilization) advanced by employers (page 25). The Spanish 2000 NAP interprets as a positive development the increase in the use of part-time contracts, but does not say anything about the gender equality dimension of this increase. This is surprising (and regrettable) since the overwhelming majority of those who work on a part-time basis are women. There is no doubt that part-time jobs are better for women than unemployment. Nevertheless, an increase in the proportion of part-time work may often mean the appearance of a gender imbalance as for the full integration in the labour market.

With respect to parental and other family-related leaves, these are a priority objective in the Spanish 2000 NAP. The main goals of the Plan are: "to foster active labor policies; modernize public employment services; improve vocational training; develop the Information Society; support small companies; and boost [gender] equal opportunities (fostering devices to combine family and professional responsibilities, and eliminating gender discrimination)" (page 12). The Spanish 2000 NAP makes references to parental and other family-related leaves mainly in the sections dedicated to the 1999 and 2000 gender-equality policies (for instance, in pages 11 and 13). Since it is pillar four the pillar, which contains measures related to these leaves, we discuss these leaves in length in section number three of this report. Here we assess as very positive the attention paid by the Plan to the combination of family and professional life. Many female workers find very hard to fulfil professional and family duties. A first step to solve a difficulty is to define it as a "problem" requiring attention and perhaps governmental intervention. Nevertheless, we criticize that the Spanish 2000 NAP conceptualized the combination of family and labour market duty as a women's problem. Women find difficult to perform paid employment and look after dependent relatives for many reasons, among them, that mainly women (but hardly men) take care of relatives. Therefore, a necessary step in the solution of the problem is that men participate in care and household duties. It may also be necessary to foster caring services (such as child care centers or home helps). As shown below, the Spanish 2000 Plan is basically silent about men's participation in caring and domestic tasks, and only makes vague references but not concrete commitments about the development of caring services. The Spanish 2000 Plan proposes to develop parental and other family-related leaves for women to combine professional and family duties. If only women "benefit" from these leaves, there is the permanent risk that women become less attractive workers than men, because family obligations make them less available and committed to labour market duties. It is surprising that not a single reflection of the potentially negative impact of leaves on women is made in the Spanish 2000 NAP.

(ii) The Spanish 2000 NAP contains objectives and measures which are at best likely not to increase gender inequalities, that is they conform to a defensive definition of mainstreaming. One of these policies is the promotion of training. As said, training for the employed and the unemployed is one of the main objectives of the Spanish 2000 NAP. The Plan explicitly states that training for the unemployed (and other measures directed to the unemployed) will be preferentially directed to women, since women are overrepresented among the unemployed (page 15). Regarding on-the-job training, the

---

9 This agreement was not signed by the employers' organizations. This agreement increased the social protection of part-time workers in some circumstances (especially those with a short working time). Part-time jobs are defined as those whose working time is up to 77% of the working time established for full-time jobs. Part-time contracts must specify the working schedule (to avoid that part-time workers had to work whenever the company ask them so) (Consejo Económico y Social, 1999:253-257).
Plan declares that women will benefit more than men from these services (page 17). It is reasonable to expect that these goals are achieved in year 2000, since (as already said) according to the Spanish 2000 NAP, 59% of the beneficiaries of training programs were women in 1999.

Unfortunately, nothing is said about many of the characteristics of the training programs for the employed and the unemployed. In the absence of this information, we cannot fully evaluate the gender impact of the training programs proposed by the Spanish 2000 NAP. Training programs will probably diminish gender inequalities if training increases the employability of women in sectors of the economy where stable and/or well-paid jobs are being created and is likely that these will be created in the future. If training increases the employability of women in sectors with dead-end poorly-paid jobs (or no new jobs at all), training programs will probably not help diminish gender inequalities.

(iii) The Spanish 2000 NAP contains goals and initiatives within the first three pillars which are potentially consistent with a proactive approach to gender mainstreaming, for example, the objective of increasing the participation in the labor market of the population of working age (in Spain, between 16 and 65 years). This goal is implicitly present through the whole plan. Since the Spanish activity and employment rate is much lower than the EU average, the objective of fostering the employability of Spaniards of active age makes a lot of sense. A crucial first step to achieve a higher degree of gender equality between women and men in Spain is that more women perform paid work. It is important to remember now that the Spanish female unemployment rate is much higher than the EU average and higher than the Spanish male unemployment rate. Many of these numerical differences among the genders are explicitly acknowledged in the Spanish 2000 NAP (pages 1, 2, 3, 10 and 14).

The emphasis on women's entrance in the labour market made by the Spanish 2000 Plan is very positive. Nevertheless, proposing measures that presumably increase female participation in the labour market (such as training) is not enough to substantially reduce gender inequality. Almost nothing is said in the Plan about the obstacles that women may face when already working, such as discrimination regarding pay or opportunities for promotion, horizontal segregation or sexual harassment, to name just some of them. Nothing is said in the Plan about these problems. From reading the NAP, one could conclude that the only problem that women had once in the labour market is the difficulty of combining professional and family responsibilities. Unfortunately, women face many additional problems about which the Spanish 2000 NAP is absolutely silent.

2.3. Coherence and consistency in the gender mainstreaming approach

In this section we assess the coherence and consistency in the approach to gender mainstreaming. We have already explained that mainstreaming is weakly present in the Spanish 2000 NAP. We have found very few instances in the first three pillars of the plan in which a gender perspective is present in employment policies. Subsequently, we have found quite a few instances of inconsistencies or conflicts regarding mainstreaming.

---

10 Training for the employed is now administered by the social partners, while training for the unemployed is not.

11 We refer here to the document elaborated by the Spanish government. We manage to obtain Appendix 3 of the Spanish 2000 NAP, which contains the comments made by the main trade unions and employers’ organization to the NAP. The former but not the latter made explicit references to the obstacles encountered by women once in the labor market. We would like to thank Lola Liceras and Encarna Signes from CC.OO, for sending us the complete version of the Spanish NAP 2000 and many internal documents. They have provided us with very valuable information that we have tried to incorporate in this report.
As already said, one of the measures proposed by the Spanish 2000 NAP is to foster the use of parental leave and other leaves to care for relatives. Inconsistencies may arise if these leaves are in fact taken by an increasing number of women. The reason is that the plan does not promote the increase in the (scarce) supply of child care facilities. Therefore, the promotion of leaves is not matched by that of child care facilities and other caring facilities, once the leaves end and women try to return to the labor market. The plan refers very vaguely to the aforementioned services. These references are so abstract and indeterminate, that it is reasonable to expect that nothing important will be done in this policy area.

In the evaluation of the 1999 NAP it is said that "Education programs that include child care such as pre-school education...have increased 42%" (page 11). This reference is so vague that it is impossible to know which education programs is the plan referring to. The Spanish 2000 NAP proposes "to foster local development, supporting newly created companies...Priority will be given to projects regarding...child care centers" (page 20, guideline 12). It is not said how much money will be dedicated to child care centers, nor how many centers (if any) will be affected by this measure. It is also said that "support will be given to workers' geographical mobility...helping them regarding expenses on child care provided in centers" (page 23, guideline 16). Again, nothing is said about the details to implement this policy, such as the money dedicated to his measure, the estimated number of beneficiaries, or the minimum and/or maximum amount of the aforementioned help by beneficiary.

In the joint communication on the evaluation of the National Action Plan 2000 made by CC.OO and UGT trade unions, interesting suggestions that highlight inconsistencies are related to the reorganisation of working time, care services, employment quality, unemployment protection and legislative initiatives (CC.OO and UGT, 2000). As already said, none of the NAPs, including the current NAP, have addressed the very basic issue of the gender distribution of paid and unpaid work. This is the basis for the incoherence of the gender mainstreaming approach in the Spanish NAPs. The recognition of the need of a legislative initiative promoting the negotiation of the reorganisation of working time at the firm level in the framework of an Agreement between the social partners is the only possible way to make compatible both family and professional life, not only for women, but also for men. In addition, community services need to be further expanded both as a way to increase the public supply of care services that allow women access to the labour market and as a source of job creation that can boost high quality female employment. A coordinated plan at all the levels Central Administration, Regional Governments, Municipalities, etc. was proposed by CC.OO and UGT to be included in the 2000 NAP.

2.4. Mechanisms for implementing gender mainstreaming

The Spanish 2000 NAP does not establish mechanisms for implementing gender mainstreaming within the policy-making process. The Plan does not contained any guideline for mainstreaming. The Plan does not mention any method adopted for ensuring that mainstreaming is given attention at both lower and higher levels of policy-making. Generally speaking, central-state policy-makers in the area of employment hardly have access to specialist advice on gender within their own departments. Nevertheless, these policy-makers can rely on the advice of the main gender equality policy machinery of the central state: the Women's Institute.

3. Assessing the priority accorded to gender equality

This section aims to assess the priority accorded in actual practice to gender equality within the

---

12 In Spain there are only 89 persons employed in community services in comparison to 113 employed in the EU.
overall employment policy program. First, we examine pillar four of the Spanish 2000 NAP, which is entirely dedicated to gender equality measures. Second, we analyze the priority accorded to gender equality in the whole Spanish 2000 NAP.

3.1. Assessment of pillar 4 of the Spanish 2000 NAP.

As noted, the Spanish 2000 plan is very weak regarding gender mainstreaming (the inclusion of a gender perspective in the formulation, implementation and evaluation of any public policy). Rather, in an attempt to strengthen equal opportunities for women and men in the labour market, the Spanish 2000 plan contains measures directed to women. These policies for working women are included mainly in pillar 4.

We assess very positively the fact that policies for working women are included in the Spanish 2000 NAP, because it is one of the main documents of employment policies. This inclusion provides policies for women with a high degree of publicity. In this regard, the elaboration of NAPs marks an improvement regarding the diffusion of information on policies to enhance the employment status of women. Generally speaking, before the NAPs these types of policies were not part of the main documents of employment policies. These types of policies were reflected in a myriad of pieces of legislation of lower order. It was difficult to compile all these pieces of legislation and to have a broad perspective of these policies. It is important to note that Spain, differently to other countries such as Italy, has not an equality law.

While assessing pillar 4 of the Spanish 2000 NAP, we pay attention to: (i) its content; (ii) the identification of actors involved in the implementation of concrete measures; (iii) the degree of abstraction or specificity of concrete initiatives; and (iv) the relative importance of pillar 4 in comparison with pillars 1, 2 and 3.

(i) Regarding the content of pillar 4 of the Spanish 2000 NAP, there are basic continuities between policies for working women elaborated between 1975 and the mid-1990s, and measures included in the Spanish 2000 NAP. As was the case of previous policies, the Spanish 2000 NAP includes measures to combine family and professional responsibilities, which mainly consist in parental and other family leaves, and not so much in the availability of care services. The Spanish 2000 NAP proposes to develop Act on combination of workers' family and professional duties (Ley de conciliación de la vida familiar y profesional de las personas trabajadoras) (page 24). This Act was approved in on 5 November 1999. This Act mainly deals with parental and other family leaves. Fathers are allowed to take up to ten weeks of maternity leave (before they were allowed to take up to four weeks). Non paid leaves of a year of duration are permitted in order to take care of adult relatives (before 1999, these leaves were only permitted to take care of children younger than three years). Workers can benefit from a reduction of between a third and half of the working time (with the parallel reduction of salary) to take care of a relative who needs the care of other person (before 1999, workers could benefit from this right only to take care of a child younger than six or a handicapped person). On the other hand, pillar 4 only contains some vague mentions to the potential development of care services such as child care (page 24, guideline 20) (see below).

Some affirmative actions of pilot nature (which affect few participants and imply low costs) were undertaken before the elaboration of the NAPs. The Spanish 2000 NAP also contains this type of affirmative actions. Incentives will also be given to labour contracts to hire women in sectors where women are under-represented (page 23, guideline 19). Finally, incentives for female entrepreneurship will also exist (page 23). The only affirmative action contained in the Spanish 2000 NAP which may affect a relevant number of women is the proposal that permanent labour contracts for female workers
will be given more incentives than permanent labour contracts for male workers (page 23).

The Spanish 2000 plan pays a lot of attention to training for the employed and the unemployed. This emphasis on training is also a characteristic of the 1999 NAP. Pillar 4 of the 2000 NAP repeats what has been said in previous parts of the plan: that the majority of beneficiaries of training activities for the unemployed will be women, since women are over-represented among the unemployed (page 23). Pillar 4 states that training and orientation services will be given to women who are in special circumstances: parents on parental leave; lone mothers; victims of domestic violence; long-term unemployed, and women with "special difficulties" (page 24, guideline 21).

In sum, from a historical perspective, between 1975 and the mid-1990s, and in the Spanish 2000 NAP we can find: measures to help women combine family and professional responsibilities; and affirmative actions of pilot nature. The emphasis on training is a characteristic of the NAPs (and is present in the Spanish 2000 NAP), but not so much of the policies for working women elaborated between 1975 and the mid-1990s. Finally, after the end of the authoritarian regime, policy-makers revised labour laws, in order to make women and men equal before the law. This process was mainly completed before the NAPs were elaborated, so the NAPs do not revise legislation in this regard.

(ii) With respect to the identification of actors involved in the implementation of concrete measures, this dimension of pillar 4 is weak. At the beginning of pillar 4 it is said: "The following actors will take part in measures of this pillar [pillar number 4]: the Ministries of Labor and Social Affairs, Education and Culture, Defense, and Industry and Energy; regions; localities; the Women's Institute and gender equality units of the regions; and social partners" (page 23). Nevertheless, it is never said whose actor is going to be in charge of which concrete measure. In this regard, the 2000 NAP is much worse than the 1999 NAP, which used to identify the actors involved in the measures under each guideline.

(iii) As regards the degree of abstraction or specificity of concrete initiatives, vagueness characterize most of the measures of pillar 4. Three examples will illustrate this point. It is said that "policy-makers will design a plan of actions to disseminate information on measures undertaken by different state units and directed to private companies in order to foster the integration of women in the labour market" (page 23, guideline 18). But it is not specified who, when, and with what resources this plan of actions will be developed. The Spanish 2000 NAP also states that "the Act on combination of family and professional responsibilities will be implemented and developed, paying special attention to parental leaves and to the regulation of protective action" (page 24, guideline 20). It is not explained on what this development consists. The Spanish 2000 NAP also affirms that policy-makers will "promote, in cooperation with localities and regions, a plan on child care centers with public funds, in order to create female employment and allow women's labour force participation". It is not said on what this plan consists. It is important to remember that if objectives are abstract and vague, it will be impossible later on to evaluate whether these have been achieved or not.

In contrast, a minority of initiatives of pillar 4 have been drawn with the appropriate degree of specificity. For instance, it is said that "women will be the beneficiaries of training activities at least proportionally to their presence among the unemployed" (page 23, guideline 18). It is also stated that "incentives to permanent contracts will be five points higher when used to hire women" (page 23, guideline 19).

(iv) In respect to the relative importance of pillar 4 in comparison with pillars 1, 2 and 3, pillar 4 is the least important pillar. The length of pillar 4 is the shortest (1 page), while 5 pages are dedicated to pillar 1, 3 pages to pillar 2 and 1.5 pages to pillar 3. The resources dedicated to pillar 4 and to any other gender equality policies and gender mainstreaming are small but not insignificant (see below).
3.2. Assessment of the priority accorded to gender equality in the whole 2000 NAP (and not only in pillar 4)

In order to assess the priority accorded to gender equality in the whole 2000 NAP (and not only in pillar 4) we focus on: (i) the size and share of the employment-policy related budget devoted to gender equality and gender mainstreaming measures; (ii) the disaggregation of targets by gender; (iii) evidence of new policies or new initiatives related to gender equality issues; (iv) evidence of the development of 'flanking' policies to provide the appropriate background for the implementation of gender equality measures in employment; and (v) the involvement of women and equal opportunities pressure groups in the drawing up of the National Action Plan.

(i) As for the size and share of the employment-policy related budget devoted to gender equality and gender mainstreaming measures, we need to stress first that an effort has been done in the 2000 NAP, in relation to previous NAPs in the presentation and clarification of the budget allocated to the fourth pillar. This is remarkable when we compare with other pillars, which make a fragmentary presentation by guidelines, and the total budget that does not even appear in the plan. The Women’s Institute has made the compilation of the information, both the budget for the year 2000 and the expenditure of 1999. As far as we know from the available information we have tried to obtain an approximation to the budget of the employment action plan in Table 21 in the Appendix. Even if the share of the total budget devoted to the fourth pillar is only 0.7% in 2000, it has increased from an insignificant share of 0.1% in the previous year 1999. The increase of this share parallels the increase of the total budget from 6,611 ECU in 1999 to 16,159 ECU in 2000. It is also remarkable that the relative variation has been much higher in the fourth pillar than in the total budget (1223.7% as compared with 144.4%). Despite the fact that this extraordinary increase in the 4th pillar is due to the very low basis of departure, this increase is a positive indicator of the potential attention devoted to equal opportunities, not only in the statement of principles but also in terms of resources. The programs of pillar four receiving more economic resources in 2000 (guideline 20) are all the programs related to the conciliation of family and professional life which represent 0.6% of the total budget of the NAP. It is important to note the significant increase of the share from the previous 1999 NAP, where it was near 0% (in that case when comparing with resources devoted to the corresponding guideline 21). The fact that a considerable greater effort is devoted to the development of the conciliation law approved in 1999 could partly offset the vagueness of the objectives of guideline 20 already mentioned in the assessment of pillar four. On the same vein, it has to be noted the increase of resources devoted to the development of statistical information and dissemination of women in the labour market (from 0.014 million ECU in 1999 NAP guideline 19, to 0.6 million ECU in 2000 NAP guideline 18). This could also suggest some progress is going to be made on the possibility to develop a system of indicators to monitor gender issues if the future.

(ii) In regard to the disaggregation of targets by gender, this dimension of the plan is very weak. As explained earlier, gender mainstreaming in the Spanish 2000 NAP is almost absent. In contrast, the plan contains gender equality policies directed to women. Therefore, hardly any general target is disaggregated by gender. Equal employment policies are directed to women only. Note also that there has been an increase in the total budget from 6,611 million ECU in 1999 to 16,159 million ECU in 2000.

(iii) Regarding evidence of new policies or new initiatives related to gender equality issues, if we compare the 2000 and 1999 NAPs we hardly see new policies and initiatives. This absence is not necessarily negative, because not all new measures are better than measures already implemented.
However, this absence of innovation may reflect a weak attention from the government to the problem of gender inequality in the labour market. This weak attention is not enough to set in motion creative and imaginative measures to tackle the aforementioned problem.

(iv) With respect to evidence of the development of 'flanking' policies to provide the appropriate background for the implementation of gender equality measures in employment, the Spanish 2000 NAP is chiefly silent in this regard. Examples of these 'flanking' measures would be the establishment of a care infrastructure, the promotion of women's involvement in decision-making or the reform of the tax and benefit system. The Spanish 2000 NAP makes only very few, very vague and passing references to the establishment of a care infrastructure. The Spanish 2000 NAP does not say anything at all about the presence of women in decision-making nor about the reform of the tax and benefit system, favoring equal opportunities.

(v) As regards the involvement of women and equal opportunities pressure groups in the drawing up of the National Action Plan, in general gender-equality policies of the central state are often demanded by feminists within the Women's Institute, political parties and trade unions. Frequently, the impact of the European Union is also important to initiate this type of policy. The Spanish 2000 NAP often makes reference to the Women's Institute. Women's departments of the main trade unions have attempted to influence the drawing of the Spanish 2000 Plan. Many of the proposals of the women's departments of the main trade unions are contained in Appendix 3. Proposals from the women's departments regarding gender equality go much further than the government's document. Unions demand (in a long section) a comprehensive system of care infrastructure with high-quality services understood not only as a devise to foster women's participation in the labor market, but as a universal welfare entitlement (a part of the citizenship package). Unions also asked for the elaboration of an Act on equality which, among other things, contains: the principle of equal pay for work of equal value; and explicit definition of sexual harassment in the work place; and a more equal presence of men and women in examination boards to enter the civil service. Unions also propose mandatory hiring of replacement workers when workers are on parental and other family-related leaves, and reforms in these leaves increasing workers' rights (pages 10 and 14 of Appendix 3).

In Spain, employers organizations do not have any department specifically dedicated to gender equality. Generally speaking, employers' organizations have been very reluctant to measures in this policy area. Regarding the Spanish 2000 NAP, Appendix 3 also contains employers' proposals regarding gender equality in employment. These proposals are very brief (only 3 paragraphs). Employers assess positively the fact that in the last years women participate in increasing numbers in the labour market. Nevertheless, employers believe that equal opportunity policies have to take place mainly in the education and training systems (that is, outside companies). Companies cannot be the main arenas for gender equality measures, since companies have to adapt to a highly competitive environment. Employers support the mentions of the Spanish 2000 NAP to a plan of child care centers, services to support the family and lone mothers, although they think that the plan should be more concrete about the budget with which to finance these measures (page 5 of Appendix 3). It is important to note that all these measures take place outside the realm of private companies.


In this part of the report we identify priority areas for future action with respect to: (i) policies; (ii) monitoring and evaluation; and (iii) processes. We also provide two examples of "best practice".

4.1. Priority areas for future action
(i) Regarding policies, we recommend that future NAPs make women more visible, especially in the general objectives of the plan and across all pillars (and not only regarding pillar 4). More attention to gender equality has to be paid in future plans. They should allocate a higher share of the budget to equality between women and men.

A stronger effort on gender mainstreaming is our second advice. Future plans will have to be stronger than the Spanish 2000 NAP at least in a defensive mainstreaming approach, which consists in monitoring policies and programs to ensure that they do not exacerbate gender inequality. Future plans will also have to contain a more proactive gender mainstreaming approach, which happens when policies are promoted within the general employment program designed to reduce the gender equality deficit and to promote equal opportunities. Future plans will have to avoid policies and programs which do not fulfill the minimum requirement for gender mainstreaming --ensuring that new policies and initiatives are not likely to exacerbate gender gaps. Particular attention should be paid to part-time employment. In Spain, part-time employment developed later than in other EU member states. In a sense, Spain is in a privileged position. Spanish policy makers can observe the development of part-time employment in other countries, learn from others' experiences, and avoid to make the same mistakes that others have done in order to prevent the appearance of unintended gender inequalities.

The Spanish 2000 NAP is very weak in mainstreaming, and simply contains some policies targeted to women in pillar 4. We advise the formulation of policies for women in future plans, since women face special obstacles when they participate in the labor market. These obstacles and problems need to be addressed.

One of the aims of gender equality policies in future plans will have to continue to be the increase women's participation in the labour market. Nevertheless, once in employment, women face barriers against gender equality that need to be addressed in future NAPs, including (among others): horizontal segregation, discrimination in promotion, and sexual harassment in the work place.

The emphasis that the Spanish 2000 NAP puts on training is positive and should be maintained. Nevertheless, it is important to elaborate not so much training and/or guidance programs but mixed actions of training and employment.

The identification of the actors involved in the implementation of concrete measures has to be undertaken in future plans, since it is done vaguely (or not done at all) in the Spanish 2000 NAP. We also suggest that the degree of abstraction of measures of future plans is much lower than in the Spanish 2000 NAP. If measures are not concrete and the actors involved in their implementation are not identified, it is impossible to evaluate afterwards whether measures have been put in practice adequately or not.

The establishment of a care infrastructure is an example of 'flanking' policies, which provide the appropriate background for the implementation of gender equality measures in employment. The recommendation that the state provides care services can be done from some ideological positions but not from others. People holding liberal views would dislike this option, stating that the state intervention in the economy and society should be reduced to a minimum level. Care would then be provided either by the market, families, or a combination of both. People with a more state-intervention approach would recommend that the state provides care services. Defenders of such a position usually affirm that: the state provides these services as efficiently as the market and/or families; and it is unrealistic to propose the inclusion of more women in the labour market without the adequate supply of caring services. What the Spanish 2000 NAP does regarding these two positions is not to take explicitly any of them by referring in very vague terms to the development of care infrastructure without any concrete
commitment. We recommend that future plans do not elude the question, which is a central one.

(ii) With respect to monitoring and evaluation, future NAPs will have to describe in detail methods for assessing the gender impact of NAPs during and after its implementation. The Spanish 2000 NAP does not do anything in this regard. Monitoring and evaluation is therefore a dimension of the NAPs that will have to be substantially improved in the following years.

(iii) As regards processes, we propose to include women and women's organizations in the elaboration, implementation and evaluation of gender equality measures (see example of good practice number 1). We also advise to attempt to obtain the involvement in the elaboration and implementation of gender equality measures of economic, social and political actors usually absent in this policy area. An example of this kind of actors are banks (see example of good practice number 2).

4.2. Examples of best practice.
Two good practices are described below concerning the mechanisms and processes affecting rural women and entrepreneurship.

4.2.1. Rural development in La Manchuela (Albacete).

La Manchuela is a rural area in the North part of the province of Albacete (Comunidad Castilla-La Mancha) composed by 25 small villages, 32 thousands inhabitants devoted to vineyard cultivation. At the beginning of the 90’s this region had a decreasing population and no recognition of cultural and environmental potentialities for tourist development. From 1993 onwards, a woman Major of one of the municipalities of the region lead new forms of participation of all social actors in order to fully develop the region managing the equal opportunities instruments to involve women in the decision bodies. Nowadays, the female share is around 50% in the following organs: Mancomunidad para el Desarrollo de La Manchuela, which is the highest level political body (12 women out of 25 representatives); In the development association (Asociación para el desarrollo de La Manchuela), with a total of 197 associations (trade unions, women’s associations, financial institutions, enterprises, educational bodies and regional administration), women’s associations are the only ones to have two representatives in the highest directive organ. In addition, women represent 50% of all members of sectoral tables, with their highest participation in the table of dinamisation, where quality issues are discussed. The president of this table is also a woman heading a women’s association. The criteria to establish the social services in the region, as well as their coordination and follow-up is made by the Council of Citizens Participation (Consejo de Participación Ciudadana), where women are also present with two representatives, together with other representatives of NGO’s and young and handicapped collectives. Finally, the coordinator body (Juntas Coordinadoras) are formed by women’s associations of all the municipalities. The representatives of each association meet every two months to discuss subjects related to rural women in order to prepare the conference on rural women taking place every year, in one of the villages of the region, in turn.

Women play a decisive role in all the development programmes of the region, sharing all their potentialities to solve the problems of rural development. Women are central in the I.C. LEADER II program of local development, where positive discrimination measures are applied. The integrated centre for women employment gives legal advice and assists women in employment and training. The regional Program on social action co-ordinates action towards children, the young, women and old people. The socio-educational program of integration is directed towards young women and men in risk of social exclusion. The local pact for employment analyses the needs of women and other collectives for having a job, giving also information on the alternatives for self-employment and the firm environment of the region. Finally, the GEA program for entrepreneurship activities of rural women, gives women
advice and help to promote and commercialise their products, as well as promoting the introduction of new technologies in their businesses.

In sum, the most significant feature of this practice is the co-ordinated effort in the application and follow-up of different programmes where women are central, not only as a target group, but also as the social agents leading the development process. This in turn, has stopped the massive emigration movement of women to the urban areas, and has contributed to the demographic equilibrium in the region. Most employment opportunities came through the development of rural tourism and the social economy, where women are provided advice and training in order to provide high quality services to their clients. Women have also been promoting the association movement, where decisions are taken horizontally. Finally, they have developed transport and communication skills that allows them to travel around the region in order to fight against traditional isolation. They have also acquired the skills to publish written material to share and interchange experiences, apart from participating in exhibitions of women, both at the rural and international level. (Oñate, 2000).

4.2.2. Signature of an agreement between the Ministry of Labour and Social Affairs (Ministerio de Trabajo y Asuntos Sociales) and the bank BCH (Banco Central Hispanoamericano, S.A.) to establish a financial channel for women entrepreneurs.

This agreement establishes a specific line of credit to projects leaded by women, either as the holders of the property of the firm or as the majority of the share holders. The total amount of this credit line is two thousand million pesetas. Particular credits could cover up to 70% of planned investments. There are periods of lack for the repayment of the debts at lower than usual interest rates. There are also available quick credits and a discount line of commercial paper up to fifty million pesetas. A EURO service is planned to help the enterprises to adapt to the euro and to provide financial advice for the evaluation and analysis of investment plans. (Instituto de la Mujer, 2000).

This example of good practice involves the participation of a bank on the promotion of women entrepreneurship. The Ministry of Labour, by signing this agreement is trying to involve financial institutions into equal opportunities policies. Both women and financial institutions could be benefited from mutual interactions in opening up the possibility of establishing new businesses.

References

Comisión Europea (2000), Directrices para las políticas de empleo de los Estados miembros para el año 2000 & Recomendación del Consejo sobre la aplicación de las políticas de empleo de los Estados miembros,
Comisión Europea, Dirección general de Empleo y Asuntos Sociales, Unidad A.2


Instituto de la Mujer (2000), Línea Específica de Financiación, Convenio con el BCH, (available on http://www.mtas.es/mujer/bch.htm).


Valiente, C. (1998a), Género, mercado de trabajo y Estado de bienestar: el caso de España, Sociología del Trabajo,